

Social Media Management in Local Government: A Case Study of Bandung City Government's Instagram and Twitter (X), Indonesia

NUR ATNAN*

Telkom University, Indonesia

NUNUNG PRAJARTO

NOVI KURNIA

Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Effective social media management by the local government plays a central role in generating and shaping public engagement. Bandung City Government's just setup their Instagram and Twitter (X) accounts in year 2022, which consider having low engagement. This study aims to analyse reasons for low public engagement in the local government social media. Specifically, this study focuses on the Bandung City Government which has experienced using other social media for more than 10 years. The approach used was a case study and quantitative content analysis on Instagram and Twitter (X) accounts during the 2022 period. The results showed that the social media management of the Bandung City Government has not been effective in creating high-quality engagement. The team has not been able to optimize planning activities to create creative content. According to the needs of citizens, interaction and response to public comments are still inconsistent. In addition, evaluation activities have not been optimally used to improve management strategy improvements. The results of this study have important implications for social media management practices in local governments. The weaknesses of social media management found in this study can be used as lessons learned by other local governments to increase engagement with the public.

Keywords: *Local government, social media, social media management, public engagement, Twitter (X).*

INTRODUCTION

Social media has many benefits for local governments including encouraging collaboration to create efficiency in government processes, helping performance productivity, improving public services, encouraging democratization and assisting knowledge management and policy formulation (Criado & Villodre, 2021; Hružová & Hružá, 2021; Maziashvili et al., 2022; Sobaci, 2015). Social media is an application that offers a new channel of communication between local governments and the public. This new channel of communication allows the public to be widely involved in government affairs (Guillamón et al., 2016; Li & Chan, 2017) and provides an opportunity for dialogical communication at a relatively low cost (Kavanaugh et al., 2012). Using social media, a large amount of information can be published in real-time to a wider audience (Bonsón et al., 2012).

The high advantages of social media encourage the Government of Indonesia to require local governments to own and use social media to communicate with the public. This was emphasised by the Ministry of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform (KemenPANRB) through Ministerial Regulation Number 83 of 2012 concerning Guidelines for the Utilization of Social Media for Government Agencies. In terms of technical matters, in 2018, the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology provided guidance on how

to maximize the use of social media for government institutions. The availability of formal and technical guidelines for social media optimization is expected to facilitate local governments in strengthening communication, establishing interaction, and improving the quality of public services.

There are many local governments in Indonesia, but Bandung City Government is interesting to be studied due to its early usage of social media. The Bandung City Government has been using social media since 2012. Bandung City Government is also the first local government in Indonesia to adopt social media as one of the media of communication with the public. At first, the social media created were Facebook and Twitter (X). However, currently, other social media such as Instagram, TikTok, and YouTube have also been adopted as a medium of communication with the public. Of the various social media owned, the two dominant social media used are Instagram and Twitter (X) (Atnan & Abrar, 2023).

Despite its early usage of social media, the *engagement* score of the Bandung City Government's social media accounts, especially Instagram and Twitter (X) accounts, is still relatively low, especially in 2022. Based on the results of researcher observations using the ISA (Intelligence Socio Analytics) application, the averages ratio between posts and comments is only 0,21 on Twitter (X) and 1,39 on Instagram. The figure of 139 percent on Instagram seems high, but if we look at monthly data, from September-December 2022, the average comment rate is zero percent. While the average ratio between posts and *retweets/shares* is zero percent on Instagram and 10.6 percent on Twitter (X). In conclusion, the average *engagement* score is 21.2 percent for Instagram and 0.03 percent for Twitter (X). The low *engagement* on social media of the Bandung City Government may reflect a serious problem in the social media management of the Bandung City Government.

The issue of local government social media and the quality of *engagement* has been widely researched by academics. The results of research from several academics provide recommendations on how to encourage and increase public *engagement* in the local government social media. Some researchers suggested a better organisation of social media content (Bonsón et al., 2019; Dominic & Gisip, 2021; Furqon et al., 2018; Santoso et al., 2020; Su & Li, 2023). Some researchers offer another way of conducting dialogical and interactive communication (Alam et al., 2022; Al-Masaeed, 2019; Evans et al., 2018; Gálvez-Rodríguez et al., 2018; Haro-de-Rosario et al., 2018; Idris, 2018; Izzati et al., 2018; Purwadi et al., 2019; Rexhepi et al., 2021; Soon & Soh, 2014).

This study offers novelty compared to previous studies. The novelty of this research is the management approach in managing local government social media to create *high-quality engagement*. This approach offers a more holistic effort to create *high-quality engagement*. With a case study approach and quantitative content analysis, this study analyses why social media management adopted by the Bandung City Government has not been able to create *high-quality engagement*. Challenges and obstacles in each stage of social media management will be identified so that the findings of this study can be used as lessons learned by other local governments to increase *engagement* with the public.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Engagement in Local Government Social Media

Social media has become a promising *platform* for online participation (Ramanair, 2020). This is because there are so many users and the way to access it is very easy. This ease of access encourages everyone to express their views on certain topics of interest (Ainin et al., 2020;

Chugh et al., 2019; Mostafa, 2020). This condition encourages local governments to increase citizen involvement in social and political affairs (Haro-de-Rosario et al., 2018).

In the context of digital relations, *Engagement* is interpreted as a condition that occurs in a *platform* digital, where a person with a certain intention and motivation establishes a relationship with another party through interaction, communication, and mutual influence with each other (Johnston, 2023). *Engagement* digital is indicated by the actions of like, comment, and share of the information obtained (Yoon et al., 2018). If only likes and comments, for Johnston and Taylor (2018) it falls into the category of *low engagement* level. However, if it is accompanied by interaction, collaboration, and sharing information with other parties then the level of *engagement/* falls into the high category of *High-Quality Engagement* (Johnston & Taylor, 2018).

Quality *Engagement* It can also be seen from research by de Oliveira Santini et al. (2020). Although this study analysed aspects of customer attachment to products in the form of goods through social media, researchers adopted it for the context of government service products. de Oliveira Santini et al. (2020) divided the area of *Engagement* into three levels, *Relationship Formation*, *Customer Engagement Creation* *Customer Engagement Contribution*. The highest tier of *Engagement* is *Customer Engagement Contribution*, where someone not only shows their relationship by showing likes and giving positive comments about the product on social media but also tells and shares interesting experiences about the product he feels (de Oliveira Santini et al., 2020).

This study defines *high-quality engagement* from a combination of concepts proposed by Gordon et al. (2013), Johnston and Taylor (2018), with de Oliveira Santini et al. (2020). *High-quality engagement* is characterized by high interaction, commenting on public issues, delivering *feedback* related to the service, and sharing important information with others through *retweets* or *shares*. Some of these indicators will be a reference in reflecting the extent to which social media management carried out by the Bandung City Government creates *high-quality engagement* on its social media.

Factors Driving Engagement on Local Government Social Media

The study of 29 local governments in Andalusia showed that a significant factor driving citizen engagement on social media, especially Twitter (X), was the content factor. The types of content that generate high interaction are photos and videos. Sports-themed content and city promotions received the most likes and received the highest *reaction to retweets*, while content with environmental and public transportation themes received the most comments from citizens. Other aspects such as city status (big city or small town), posting activity, and number of *followers* do not affect citizen *engagement* (Bonsón et al., 2019).

The experience of one city in New Zealand, Aotearoa City that five things influence citizens *to engage* on social media, especially the regional government's Facebook, namely content quality, active post creativity, increasing the number of followers, a combination of passive and active posts, and creating a diverse and inclusive digital environment (Alam et al., 2022). The schedule and frequency of posting content do not so a significant effect on *engagement* rates. Content plays an important and dominant role in creating *engagement*.

The power of messages or content in increasing *citizen engagement* on social media, especially Facebook, is also proven in five local governments in Greece. Content that is informational for the sake of transparency and fostering the image of the city encourages *more engagement* in the form of likes. Messages posted in response to citizens' questions or

comments are very significant in encouraging citizen comments. While informational messages in the form of invitations to participate *offline* in city events, significantly encourage *engagement* in the form of comments and shares (Lappas et al., 2022).

In the Netherlands, the intensity of citizen interaction on local government social media is influenced by political, institutional, and socio-economic aspects. The political aspect relates to the identity of officials and the level of competition of officials in political contestation. The institutional aspect relates to how long local governments use social media platforms. While socio-economic aspects are related to the level of education, age, and digital abilities of citizens (Faber et al., 2020).

Social Media Management in Multiple Countries

For Villodre and Criado (2020), social media will be effective for local governments if the process of institutionalizing social media is carried out. This institutionalization led to the concept of social media management. Based on the results of a study on city governments in Spain, four things need to be considered in social media management, namely social media guidance, political leadership, social media training, evaluation mechanisms, and self-perception of social media development. Social media guidelines are principles, objectives, procedures, or guidelines that must be followed in the use and management of social media in public bodies (Villodre & Criado, 2020).

The study of Villodre et al. (2021), on two local governments in the Netherlands, namely in the cities of Utrecht and Eindhoven related to the institutionalization of social media managers shows that there are two organizational models in the institutionalization of social media. The organizational model practiced is a centralized model and a distributed model. A centralized model is one where social media manager are centralized in one department. Social media planning, management, and evaluation are carried out by specialized departments. The role of other departments is limited to coordination. A distributed model is a model that agrees that social media management is distributed across multiple departments in an organization. Consequently, the organization will form a special team containing representatives from each department (Villodre et al., 2021).

Chen et al. (2016) in a study on social media management policies in the Chinese Government, summarized several elements related to structuring or regulating social media. There are six main elements to social media management: account management, content management, resource management, *online interaction*, security issues, and performance evaluation. Account management consists of three dimensions, namely account registration, account presentation, and account termination. Content management deals with six aspects, namely content source, content scope, content checking, content style, content accessibility, and content archiving. Resource management includes two things, namely financial resources, and human resources. The aspect of *online interaction* consists of two aspects, namely employee responsiveness and citizen comment rules. Related to the security aspect, three aspects that need to be considered are technology security, behavioural security, and privacy security. In terms of performance evaluation, the three aspects that need attention are evaluators, content evaluation, and relevant consequences (Chen et al., 2016).

Lappas et al. (2017) explained another aspect of social media management in the form of strategies in social media management. Studies conducted on Greek Regional Governments, especially in the management of Facebook, there are four strategies applied, namely transparency strategies, marketing activities/events, providing information,

impression management, and co-design. Transparency strategy is the use of social media to open strategic things that the public needs to know. Some of the information submitted is related to services, cooperation with external parties, main programs, important meetings, important policies/decisions, procurement, and tender info (Lappas et al., 2017).

The next strategy is the activity marketing strategy. This strategy relates to the use of Facebook to market important activities organized by local governments. Some information that is always conveyed is the agenda of local government events, and invitations to the public to participate in various series of local government activities. Another strategy that is also applied is the strategy of providing information. This strategy is in the form of *important information releases*, mayoral actions, citizen activities, and light information such as weather, transportation, roads, and others (Lappas et al., 2017).

In addition to the three strategies above, another strategy for managing Facebook is the impression management strategy. This strategy relates to using Facebook to create a positive impression of the city for the public. This strategy predominantly features photos and videos relating to cityscapes, events of interest, and activities of mayors and councillors. An additional strategy following the concept proposed by Lappas et al. (2017) is a joint design strategy. This strategy relates to Facebook's use of engaging citizens in council meetings, and its invitation to volunteer in city activities (Lappas et al., 2017).

METHODOLOGY

This study uses a case study approach. This approach was chosen because this study answers in depth why social media management that has been implemented by the Bandung City Government has not been able to create *high-quality engagement*. As stated by Yin (2009) detailed and deep data about a case can be obtained, one of which is with a case study approach (Yin, 2009). With a case study approach, the hidden facts behind a phenomenon can be revealed.

Table 1: Approaches, data collection techniques, and data analysis techniques

Approach	Unearthed Aspects	Data Collection Techniques	Data Analysis Techniques
Case study	Social Media Management (Instagram and Twitter (X))	Interviews, observations, document analysis	Reduction, presentation, interpretation
Quantitative content analysis	<i>Engagement</i> conditions on Bandung City Government social media	Observation of Instagram account (@humas_bandung) and Twitter (X) account (@humasbandung_)	Using <i>social media analytics tools</i> , namely ISA (Intelligence Socio Analytics)

Note: Collected in year 2023

In-depth data on social media management is obtained through interviews, observations, and document analysis. Interviews were conducted with two groups of informants, namely key informants and supporting informants. Observations were made on teams working in managing social media. Document analysis was carried out on government regulations governing social media management in local governments and SOPs (*Standard operating procedures*) related to social media management.

The key informants in this study numbered seven (see Table 2). The criteria used in determining key informants are those who know, understand, and/or are directly involved in the management of social media of the Bandung City Government. The supporting informants amounted to 20 people 10 followers from the Instagram account and 10 followers from the Bandung City Government Twitter (X) account. The Supporting informants were determined using purposive sampling method. The criteria for supporting informants are active followers throughout 2022 and are in the top 10 most active both on Instagram accounts and Twitter (X) accounts owned by the Bandung City Government. Using the ISA (Intelligence Socio Analytics) application, researchers found the 10 most active accounts on Instagram and the 10 most active accounts on Twitter (X) belonging to the Bandung City Government (see Table 2).

Table 2: List of key informants and supporting informants

ID	Key Informants	Supporting Informant (Account)			
		ID	Instagram	ID	Twitter (X)
A.1	PIH Mayor of Bandung Head of Bandung City	B.1	@bungaaditamy	C.1	@Bajultobat
A.2	Communication and Information Agency Head of Information Dissemination	B.2	@tito_4724	C.2	@diyoeX
A.3	Kasi Strengthening Public Information Disclosure	B.3	@jessiekhimawan	C.3	@GustiPerwira
A.4	Social Media Management Staff 1	B.4	@yimao_yimao_yuehao30	C.4	@ravapurnomo
A.5	Social Media Management Staff 2	B.5	@rakacendekia	C.5	@tbgerryrangga
A.6	Social Media Management Staff 3	B.6	@auliamld	C.6	@Ontha04273470
A.7	-	B.7	@littleleponi	C.7	@akuluthfi
8.	-	B.8	@matnur.ridho	C.8	@Syamsud76579252
9.	-	B.9	@prat.ama970	C.9	@panca66
10.	-	B.10	@jessiekhimawan	C.10	@tvindonesiawkwk

Note: Collected in year 2023

In addition to using a case study approach, this study also uses a quantitative content analysis approach. The quantitative content analysis approach is used as support to identify initial data related to account profiles and engagement conditions on the Bandung City Government's Instagram and Twitter (X) accounts. This initial data was collected by observing content and interactions that occurred on Instagram and Twitter (X) accounts from January 2022 to December 2022. These preliminary data are needed to support social media management analyses that researchers assume are problematic.

RESULTS

Bandung City Government Social Media Management

Broadly speaking, the social media management (Instagram and Twitter (X)) of the Bandung City Government managed by the Communication and Information Agency (DISKOMINFO) consists of three stages, namely planning, implementation, and evaluation. The planning stage is preparing, producing, and determining the content delivery strategy. The implementation stage is to manage content and establish interaction with the public. The

evaluation stage is to measure the impact and success rate of content that has been presented in a certain period.

Planning

Three important things are done by the Bandung City Government's social media management team at the planning stage: determining themes or issues, agreeing on strategies, and producing content. Determination of themes or issues and strategy discussions are carried out by the Social Media Team together with the leadership. Production activities are carried out by the Social Media Team in collaboration with several other teams such as the Coverage Team, Broadcast Team, and Editor Team (ID A.4, A.5, and A.6 Informers).

The study found several key things in content planning that have an impact on high and low *Engagement* on social media. In Instagram content planning, the determination of the theme, still very dominant refers to the city government program, *Events* in Bandung City, and national holidays/religious holidays. In addition, themes also sometimes refer to problems that are developing in society and current issues *Trend* on social media. Once the theme is identified, the next step in the planning stage is to choose a priority theme. The study found that the selected theme was determined in the meeting *Agenda Setting*. In this process, the team will ask the leadership for consideration. In choosing a theme, leaders and management teams have certain standards. Usually, what is chosen is a theme related to problems in society, a *request* from the highest leadership, the most complaints based on LAPOR and *Hotline* 112, as well as the agenda of the city government that is urgent to be known by the public (Informant ID A.4 and A.7).

After the priority theme is chosen, the next stage is to carry out content production. Several strategies are used before creating content. The first strategy refers to the leader's message, that social media should be *Citizen Centre*. The point is that social media is used as a suggestion to present *Feedback* that is felt by the community towards the services that have been provided by the Bandung City Government. Therefore, the social media management team on several occasions created citizen testimonial content. The second strategy is to insert content that is relaxed and relevant to people's information needs. For example, content related to tourist info, culinary, and other things needed such as vaccine services, free animal examinations, health checks, and others (Informants A.5 and A.7). Unlike Instagram, content planning on Twitter (X) is not too complicated. There is no mechanism for determining themes in planning content. Content is directly sourced from releases that have been created by dedicated teams. The release contains news that raises hot issues about the government and the City of Bandung. The release was immediately used by the Twitter (X) Manager to be posted on the Bandung City Government's Twitter (X) account (Informers A.4 and A.7).

Table 3. Types of social media content of Bandung City Government in 2022

Content-Type	Instagram	Twitter (X)
Performance	25,8%	63,3%
Appeal	9,2%	6,7%
Knowledge	30,1%	17,2%
Big day	8,3%	3,4%
Service	14,4%	7,9%
Event	12,1%	1,4%

Note: Using ISA Application

In a series of planning processes, both on Instagram and Twitter (X), the study found that the themes chosen and the content that was ultimately produced were still predominantly formal and serious. The relaxed and entertaining content is still a little bit. Based on search results using the ISA application, throughout 2022, the content presented was predominantly related to performance and information containing knowledge (see Table 3). Performance and knowledge content is still presented in a formal setting. Meanwhile, the study also found that the characteristics of the public who follow the Bandung City Government's social media accounts prefer relaxed and entertaining content. This is illustrated by the opinions of some *followers* selected from both Instagram and Twitter (X) (see table 4).

Table 4: Types of content liked by *Followers*

Content-Type	Number of <i>Followers</i> Who Like			
	Instagram	Percentage	Twitter (X)	Percentage
Relaxed	5	50%	4	40%
Entertaining	3	30%	4	40%
Contains travel, culinary info	1	10%	1	10%
Contains service info	1	10%	1	10%

Note: Using ISA Application

Implementation

At the implementation stage, the two main activities carried out by the Bandung City Government's social media management team are managing and arranging content that has been produced and interacting with the public. In managing content, what is regulated is how much content will be posted each day and at what time the content is posted. Related to interaction with the public, the activity of the social media management team is to observe the public's response to the content they present and respond or answer if there is a reaction including if there are questions from the public (Informant ID A.1 and A.2).

Throughout 2022, the average amount of content posted on Instagram accounts is three, while on Twitter (X) accounts is one. Posting time is done three times a day, namely in the morning, afternoon, and evening. Based on the results of the researchers' interviews, the consideration of choosing the amount of content and time is because it follows the rules of the social *media platform's algorithm* so that account activity remains active. However, the study also found that the number of three to five pieces of content that must be posted every day at any given time, especially on Instagram, is quite burdensome for the management team (Informants ID A.2 and A.6).

Two main reasons are considered burdensome, Namely, first, creative content (casual, educational, and entertaining) cannot be created in a short time. Content like this cannot be created in three to five amounts in a day. Second, the number of team members is limited. Support teams such as the Development team and the Broadcast Team who create content have other tasks. The staff of the Social Media Team of two people cannot optimally create a large amount of creative content. As a result, the ability to arrange creative content according to netizens' tastes before being posted is not optimally carried out (Informant ID A.5 and A.6).

Another activity that is quite important and strategic at the implementation stage is to build interaction with the public. The interaction can be in the form of answering questions or just giving *likes* for comments submitted by the public. The manager also has a big hand in responding to messages that are nuanced criticism. Very few local governments have the

competence to manage messages that are nuanced criticism, especially when cornering the performance of local governments. Usually, local government social media managers choose silence rather than react to critical messages, especially if they seem offensive (Informants A.4, A.5, and A.6).

The study found that the inability of social media managers to respond to critical nuanced responses is due to several things. First, Diskominfo Kota Bandung, which is in charge of content management, is not the centre of information on all things about the city of Bandung. Diskominfo only acts as a creator, collector, and organizer of content originating from almost all regional device organizations. As a result, the social media management team does not understand deeply and broadly all the issues in question by the public. If there is a public spotlight on one issue, the management team does not dare to respond due to their limited knowledge. Second, when the management team forwards criticism to the relevant unit that better understands the problem, the admin of the relevant unit is late or even does not want to respond as well. Especially if criticism is delivered outside of work time.

Table 5: Management response to public questions on Bandung City Government Instagram and Twitter (X) accounts period January 2022-December 2022

Moon	Instagram			Twitter (X)		
	Σ Questions	Σ Reply	% Reply	Σ Questions	Σ Reply	% Reply
Jan.	120	5	4,2%	94	31	33,0%
Feb.	354	125	35,3%	227	12	5,3%
Mar.	684	86	12,6%	49	10	20,4%
Apr.	110	26	23,6%	75	7	9,3%
May	89	5	5,6%	33	3	9,1%
Jun.	290	7	2,4%	30	6	20,0%
Jul.	116	5	4,3%	74	5	6,8%
Aug.	39	0	0,0%	48	6	12,5%
Sept.	25	0	0,0%	58	6	10,3%
Oct.	37	0	0,0%	36	4	11,1%
Nov.	27	0	0,0%	74	6	8,1%
Des.	41	0	0,0%	93	10	10,8%
Tot.	1.932	259	13,4%	891	106	11,9%

Note: Using ISA Application

From January 2022 to December 2022, there were around 1,932 accounts that asked questions, including conveying critical messages to the Bandung City Government through Instagram (see Table 5). Of these questions, the manager only responded to 259. This means that only 13.4% of questions were answered. The same thing happened to the *platform* Twitter (X). The number of accounts asking questions was 891. However, only 106 questions received responses from the Bandung City Government's Twitter (X) management. This means that only 11.9% of questions were answered. This figure shows that the consistency of managers in responding to public questions through social media is very low.

Evaluation

At the evaluation stage, the Bandung City Government Social Media Management Team are analysing the impact of the content that has been presented. Evaluation is carried out on content that has been posted during the past week both on Instagram and Twitter (X). The evaluation is carried out with the help of the application and the results are discussed every Friday, coinciding with agenda-setting activities (Informant ID A.5 and A.6).

Several indicators are observed and analysed in evaluation activities. On Instagram accounts, the indicators seen and measured are *Engagement*, reach, reach area, reach source, most liked posts, *Reels* with the most likes, and the most reached IG stories. On the Twitter (X) account, the indicators seen and measured are the top 3 tweets that mention Bandung City over the past week. From the results of the researcher's observations, the evaluation document only presents quantitative data from the indicators seen, but a qualitative analysis of why quantitative data was achieved is not described in the evaluation report. Evaluations are predominantly read using quantitative perspectives.

From The results of the researcher interview, the indicator that became the main concern of the leadership of Diskominfo Bandung City regarding evaluation was *Engagement*. Based on the application used by the Social Media Management Team in conducting evaluations, there are three aspects related to *engagement* is *followers*, *average likes*, and *average comments*. These three aspects are targeted to always be good. Quantitatively, the target score *Engagement* Each week is not less than one percent. If the score *Engagement* is Less than one percent, then the performance of the social media management team will be highlighted and will be subject to special sanctions so that the target *Engagement* can be achieved (Informant ID A.2).

Table 6: Factors driving followers *Engage* on Bandung City Government social media accounts

Instagram		Twitter (X)	
Informant	Factors Driving Engagement	Informant	Factors Driving Engagement
@bungaaditam	Content	@Bajultobat	Belief
@tito_4724	Belief	@diyoex	Belief
@jessiekhimawan	Interaction	@GustiPerwira	Content
@yimao_yimao_yuehao30	Interaction	@ravapurnomo	Interaction
@rakacendekia	Interaction	@tbgerryrangga	Content
@auliamld	Interaction	@Ontha04273470	Interaction
@littleuleponi	Content	@akuluthfi	Interaction
@matnur.ridho	Content	@Syamsud76579252	Interaction
@prat.ama970	Interaction	@panca66	Interaction
@jessiekhimawan	Interaction	@tvindonesiawkwk	Interaction

Note: Collected in year 2023

The study also found that content that did not receive a positive response from the public escaped the evaluation of the management team. Attention is only paid to the three most liked content. In addition, the interaction aspect is also not an indicator that the management team pays attention to evaluate. If you look at the opinion of *followers* Elected, the majority said that the way of interaction and consistency in responding to public reactions was one of the dominant factors influencing them to *engage* with local government social media accounts (see Table 6).

Conditions of Engagement on Bandung City Government Social Media

The condition of *engagement* on social media of the Bandung City Government is presented for Instagram and Twitter (X). These two social media are the dominant communication media used by the Bandung City Government. The engagement status on each social media was determined quantitatively with the help of the Intelligence Socio Analytics (ISA) application for the period January 2022-December 2022. The high and low *engagement* can be seen from how many accounts are tied to the content presented by social media managers.

This attachment can be in the form of *like, comment, share, and create content*.

Throughout January 2022-December 2022, the number of contents posted by the Bandung City Government's social media managers was 1,208 on Instagram and 9,930 on Twitter (X). These contents can reach a total of 1,048,421 accounts for Instagram and 2,644,695 accounts for Twitter (X). The location of these affordable accounts mostly comes from West Java, especially Bandung City, and some from North Sumatra, Banten, East Nusa Tenggara, North Sulawesi, and West Sulawesi. It can even reach DKI Jakarta, Aceh, Riau, East Java, and Papua.

Content is *Tools* public communication between the City Government and the public digitally. In the presence of content, *Engagement* can be created. *Engagement* shows the level of public engagement to content conveyed through posts on social media. The study found that, in general, the *Engagement* of the public on Instagram and Twitter (X) of the City Government is still very low. Average score *Engagement* It was 21.2% for Instagram (Table 7) and 0.03% for Twitter (X) (Table 7).

Table 7: *Engagement data on Bandung City Government's Instagram and Twitter (X) period January 2022-December 2022*

Moon	Reach	Instagram		Reach	Twitter (X)	
		Σ Engagement Accounts	Value Engagement		Σ Engagement Accounts	Value Engagement
Jan.	54.020	16.352	30,3%	105.250	117	0,1%
Feb.	62.325	17.588	28,2%	100.000	96	0,1%
Mar.	120.546	27.515	22,8%	110.000	29	0,0%
Apr.	100.020	21.522	21,5%	90.565	45	0,0%
May	100.690	19.369	19,2%	107.900	32	0,0%
Jun.	102.500	23.891	23,3%	84.765	62	0,1%
Jul.	100.820	20.232	20,1%	275.335	56	0,0%
Aug	100.000	16.398	16,4%	741.975	59	0,0%
Sept.	100.000	26.961	27,0%	120.935	63	0,1%
Oct.	100.000	29.603	29,6%	87.485	14	0,0%
Nov.	100.000	2.802	2,8%	205.965	153	0,1%
Des.	7.500	540	7,2%	614.520	147	0,02%
Tot.	1.048.421	222.773	21,2%	2.644.695	871	0,03%

Note: Using ISA Application

Low conditions *Engagement* on Instagram and Twitter (X) Bandung City Government is visible from the indicators *like, comment, share, and Create content*. Of the four indicators, *share* had the lowest score, namely 0.1% for Instagram and 0.04% for Twitter (X). This data shows that the public's desire to tell content on their digital networks is very low. The same condition is also indicated by indicators *Create content*. The study found that the score for *Create content* for Instagram at 0.2%, while the score for *Create content* for Twitter (X) at 0.03%. This shows that public interest in conveying information, asking questions, and even providing input or criticism related to government programs and policies is still low.

Table 8: Data Like, Comment, Share, and Create Content on Bandung City Government Instagram period January 2022- June 2022

Moon	Reach	Like		Comment		Share		Create Content	
		Sum	Value	Sum	Value	Sum	Value	Sum	Value
Jan.	54.020	21.345	40%	91	0,2%	179	0,3%	120	0,2%
Feb.	62.325	42.641	68%	223	0,4%	122	0,2%	354	0,6%
Mar.	120.546	32.326	27%	65	0,1%	35	0,03%	684	0,6%
Apr.	100.020	53.033	53%	182	0,2%	53	0,1%	110	0,1%
May	100.690	47.259	47%	112	0,1%	30	0,0%	89	0,1%
Jun.	102.500	57.972	57%	77	0,1%	78	0,1%	290	0,3%
Jul.	100.820	49.351	49%	188	0,2%	93	0,1%	116	0,1%
Aug	100.000	40.300	40%	68	0,1%	79	0,1%	39	0,04%
Sept.	100.000	63.644	64%	70	0,1%	66	0,1%	0	0,0%
Oct.	100.000	71.983	72%	38	0,0%	20	0,02%	0	0,0%
Nov.	100.000	6.793	7%	82	0,1%	180	0,2%	0	0,0%
Des.	7.500	1.500	20%	97	1,3%	119	1,6%	0	0,0%
Tot.	1.048.421	488.147	47%	1.293	0,1%	1.054	0,1%	1.802	0,2%

Note: Collected in year 2023 using ISA Application

Picture Low *Engagement* is also indicated by indicators of *comment* and *like*. Score *Comment* respectively for Instagram and Twitter (X) was 0.1% and 0.05%, while the scores respectively for Instagram and Twitter (X) were 47% and 0.1%. Data *comment* and *likes* are slightly better compared to *share* and *Create content*, although it is still generally in the low category. This condition shows that in general, the public has not been so attached to the message conveyed by the Bandung City Government. Public interaction through action *likes* and *comments* is still limited.

Table 9: Data Like, Comment, Share, and Create Content on Bandung City Government Twitter (X) period January 2022- June 2022

Moon	Reach	Like		Comment		Share		Create Content	
		Sum	Value	Sum	Value	Sum	Value	Sum	Value
Jan.	105.250	246	0,2%	91	0,1%	179	0,2%	94	0,1%
Feb.	100.000	221	0,2%	223	0,2%	122	0,1%	227	0,2%
Mar.	110.000	52	0,05%	65	0,1%	36	0,03%	49	0,04%
Apr.	90.565	92	0,1%	182	0,2%	53	0,1%	75	0,1%
May	107.900	81	0,1%	112	0,1%	30	0,03%	33	0,03%
Jun.	84.765	123	0,1%	77	0,1%	81	0,1%	30	0,04%
Jul.	275.335	64	0,02%	188	0,1%	95	0,03%	74	0,03%
Aug	741.975	110	0,01%	68	0,01%	79	0,01%	48	0,01%
Sept.	120.935	161	0,1%	70	0,1%	66	0,1%	58	0,05%
Oct.	87.485	24	0,03%	38	0,04%	20	0,02%	36	0,04%
Nov.	205.965	342	0,2%	82	0,04%	179	0,1%	74	0,04%
Des.	614.520	466	0,1%	97	0,02%	119	0,02%	93	0,02%
Tot.	2.644.695	1.982	0,1%	1.293	0,05%	1.059	0,04%	891	0,03%

Note: Collected in year 2023 using ISA Application

DISCUSSION

Three factors cause why social media management that has been carried out by the Bandung City Government Social Media Management Team has not been able to create *High-Quality Engagement*, i.e., content, interaction, and evaluation. The content presented throughout 2022, both on Instagram and Twitter (X) has not followed and is in line with the needs or desires of the public. The majority of the public especially *followers* is a generation of

Millennials (age 22-40 years). Based on findings from research states that the public needs content that is relaxed, entertaining, and light (See Table 4). While the manager presents serious content. The majority of the content presented is related to performance achievements and information that is knowledgeable.

The low creativity in creating content is also caused by institutional aspects. The Social Media Management Team is in one large unit, namely the Public Information Disclosure Strengthening Unit. The duties and functions of this unit are very broad and diverse. In addition to managing social media, this unit also manages complaints on the LAPOR application (People's Online Complaint Aspiration Service), complaints on the application *Hotline* 112, and manages Bandung Command Center (BCC). As a result, the concentration of unit heads is divided and unable to drive the Social Media Team in creating creative social media content. In addition, limited resources, both human resources and budget resources, are also a problem from the institutional aspect.

The number of staff who are responsible for managing content is only two persons while their target must publish three to five contents every day. This is quite difficult with a limited number of staff. The limited budget also affects creative power in creating content. Limited budgets result in the inability of institutions to provide supporting tools for content creation such as camera, *mobile phone*, and laptop with high specifications. As a result, acceleration in creating content, including designing content that is interesting, educates, and entertains is hampered.

The factor of uninteresting content as the cause of low *engagement* on local government social media has been proven by several previous studies. The evidence was carried out by Bonsón et al. (2019) against 29 local government social media accounts in Andalusia (Bonsón et al., 2019) and Santoso et al. (2020) against 114 local government social media accounts in Indonesia (Santoso et al., 2020). This research reaffirms that the content aspect influences the public's tendency to be interested in interacting with local governments through social media. New findings from this study that have not been analysed by previous research are about why social media managers are unable to create creative content.

The second aspect that causes the unfulfillment of *high-quality engagement* is the interaction aspect. The Social Media Management Team has not consistently responded to every public response on social media, both on Instagram and on Twitter (X). Of the 1,932 questions and responses submitted by the public on Instagram, only 13.4% responded. In Twitter (X), from 891 questions and comments submitted, only 11.9% responded. This is because the management team's knowledge of issues related to the Bandung City Government is limited. The team does not know all the issues that are the authority of regional apparatus organizations throughout the city of Bandung. As a result, team members hesitate and cannot respond to all questions raised by the public.

In addition, inconsistencies in responding to every public response are caused by members of the team working for 24 hours. As a result, when there is a response from the public to the content posted especially not in working hours, it is missed while the work system and activities of social media take place all the time. The Bandung City Government should have prepared staff who monitor social media for 24 hours. This can be done by dividing work time or it can also be done by creating a system that automatically provides answers if there are questions that arise during break hours.

The importance of interaction aspects to create *high-quality engagement* on local government social media is in line with the results of several previous studies. Gálvez-Rodríguez et al. (2018), proved on 113 local governments from 5 countries in the Latin American region (Gálvez-Rodríguez et al., 2018). Rexhepi et al. (2021) found the same in local governments in Kosovo (Rexhepi et al., 2021). Similarly, Alam et al. (2022) proved it to local governments in New Zealand (Nature et al., 2022).

The third aspect that causes *High-Quality Engagement* Not to materialize is an evaluation. Evaluation activities have been carried out, but the findings obtained have not been followed up properly. So far, the evaluation results are only used to see the achievement or impact of the content that has been posted. Achievements and impact are predominantly used to evaluate team performance. If the achievement and impact do not meet the target, the evaluation report will be used to motivate team members to work harder. Supposedly, the findings written in the evaluation report not only show quantitative data on achievements *Engagement* but also conduct a qualitative analysis of why the achievement is like that. The results of qualitative analysis will be very useful for team members to improve their ability to be more creative in creating content on social media.

CONCLUSION

Social media management, especially Instagram and Twitter (X) of Bandung City Government has not been able to create high quality engagement due to content factors that have not referred to public information needs, inconsistency in responding to public comments, and evaluations that are more inclined to quantitative approaches instead of elaborate qualitative aspects.

BIODATA

Nur Atnan is a doctoral student at the Department of Communication Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada, and a lecturer at the Communication Science Study Program, Telkom University with a focus on public communication, digital culture, and digital communication. Email: nuratnan@telkomuniversity.ac.id

Nunung Prajarto is a professor of communication science and lecturer at the Department of Communication Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada with a focus on Tourism Communication, International Communication, and Human Rights. Email: nunungprajarto@ugm.ac.id

Novi Kurnia is an Associate Professor in communication science and lecturer at the Department of Communication Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada with a focus on gender and media, film studies, digital literacy, and media political economy. Email: novikurnia@ugm.ac.id

REFERENCES

- Ainin, S., Feizollah, A., Anuar, N. B., Abdullah, N. A. B., & Sahran, M. N. F. (2020). Examining what people tweet in relation to halal cosmetics-related topics. *Cogent Arts and Humanities*, 7(1), 1724593. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311983.2020.1724593>
- Alam, A., Meenar, M., Barraza, F., Khalil, M. B., & Knopp, K. (2022). Citizen engagement on local government Facebook pages: Experience from Aotearoa New Zealand. *Cities*, 123, 103584. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2022.103584>
- Al-Masaeed, S. (2019). Social media use by government: Adoption and efficiency. *International Journal of Electronic Governance*, 11(2), 205-216. <https://doi.org/ghccs2>
- Atnan, N., & Abrar, A. N. (2023). Relation of social media literacy, trust, and information quality on public communication behaviour in urban local government social media in Indonesia. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 39(2), 210-226. <https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2023-3902-12>
- Bonsón, E., Perea, D., & Bednárová, M. (2019). Twitter as a tool for citizen engagement: An empirical study of the Andalusian municipalities. *Government Information Quarterly*, 36(3), 480-489. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2019.03.001>
- Bonsón, E., Torres, L., Royo, S., & Flores, F. (2012). Local e-government 2.0: Social media and corporate transparency in municipalities. *Government Information Quarterly*, 29(2), 123-132. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2011.10.001>
- Chen, Q., Xu, X., Cao, B., & Zhang, W. (2016). Social media policies as responses for social media affordances: The case of China. *Government Information Quarterly*, 33(2), 313-324. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2016.04.008>
- Chugh, R., Patel, S. B., Patel, N., & Ruhi, U. (2019). Likes, comments and shares on social media: Exploring user engagement with a state tourism Facebook page. *International Journal of Web Based Communities*, 15(2), 104-122.
- Criado, J. I., & Villodre, J. (2021). Delivering public services through social media in European local governments. An interpretative framework using semantic algorithms. *Local Government Studies*, 47(2), 253-275. <https://doi.org/ghccwx>
- de Oliveira Santini, F., Ladeira, W. J., Pinto, D. C., Herter, M. M., Sampaio, C. H., & Babin, B. J. (2020). Customer engagement in social media: A framework and meta-analysis. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 48(6), 1211-1228.
- Dominic, D., & Gisip, I. A. (2021). Effect of social media usage in government agencies' communication effort. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 11(3), 1452-1467. <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v11-i3/9277>
- Evans, L., Franks, P., & Chen, H. M. (2018). Voices in the cloud: Social media and trust in Canadian and US local governments. *Records Management Journal*, 28(1), 18-46. <https://doi.org/10.1108/RMJ-11-2016-0041>
- Faber, B., Budding, T., & Gradus, R. (2020). Assessing social media use in Dutch municipalities: Political, institutional, and socio-economic determinants. *Government Information Quarterly*, 37(3), 101484. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2020.101484>
- Furqon, M. A., Hermansyah, D., Sari, R., Sukma, A., Akbar, Y., & Rakhmawati, N. A. (2018). Analisis jenis posting media sosial Pemerintah Daerah di Indonesia berdasarkan like dan analisis sentimental masyarakat. *Jurnal Sositelknologi*, 17(2), 177-190. <https://doi.org/10.5614/sostek.itbj.2018.17.2.1>

- Gálvez-Rodríguez, M. del M., Sáez-Martín, A., García-Tabuyo, M., & Caba-Pérez, C. (2018). Exploring dialogic strategies in social media for fostering citizens' interactions with Latin American local governments. *Public Relations Review*, 44(2), 265-276. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2018.03.003>
- Gordon, E., Baldwin-Philippi, J., & Balestra, M. (2013). Why we engage: How theories of human behavior contribute to our understanding of civic engagement in a digital era. *Berkman Center Research Publication*, 21. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2343762>
- Guillamón, M. D., Ríos, A. M., Gesuele, B., & Metallo, C. (2016). Factors influencing social media use in local governments: The case of Italy and Spain. *Government Information Quarterly*, 33(3), 460-471. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2016.06.005>
- Haro-de-Rosario, A., Sáez-Martín, A., & del Carmen Caba-Pérez, M. (2018). Using social media to enhance citizen engagement with local government: Twitter or Facebook? *New Media and Society*, 20(1), 29-49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444816645652>
- Hrůzová, L., & Hrůza, F. (2021). Local government communication: Reaching out through Facebook. *Lex Localis - Journal of Local Self-Government*, 19(2), 217-243. [https://doi.org/10.4335/19.2.217-241\(2021\)](https://doi.org/10.4335/19.2.217-241(2021))
- Idris, I. K. (2018). Government social media in Indonesia: Just another information dissemination tool. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 34(4), 337-356. <https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2018-3404-20>
- Izzati, A. N., Pratama, A., Aristamy, I. G. A. A. M., Najwa, N. F., & Rakhmawati, N. A. (2018). Kategorisasi jenis interaksi antara pemerintah dan masyarakat dan popularitas media sosial pemerintah daerah. *Jurnal Sistem Informasi*, 14(1), 1-8. <https://doi.org/m6qf>
- Johnston, K. A. (2023). Theorizing digital engagement in public relations. In C. Botan & E. Sommerfeldt (Eds.), *Public relations theory III: In the age of publics*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003141396-5>
- Johnston, K. A., & Taylor, M. (Eds.). (2018). Engagement as communication pathways, possibilities, and future directions. In *The handbook of communication engagement* (Chap. 1). <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119167600.ch1>
- Kavanaugh, A. L., Fox, E. A., Sheetz, S. D., Yang, S., Li, L. T., Shoemaker, D. J., Natsev, A., & Xie, L. (2012). Social media use by government: From the routine to the critical. *Government Information Quarterly*, 29(4), 480-491. <https://doi.org/f4bsr2>
- Lappas, G., Triantafillidou, A., Deligiaouri, A., & Kleftodimos, A. (2017). Facebook communication strategies and their effectiveness: A case study of Greek local municipal governments. *MISNC '17: Proceedings of the 4th Multidisciplinary International Social Networks Conference*, 22, 1-6. <https://doi.org/m6qg>
- Lappas, G., Triantafillidou, A., & Kani, A. (2022). Harnessing the power of dialogue: Examining the impact of Facebook content on citizens' engagement. *Local Government Studies*, 48(1), 87-106. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03003930.2020.1870958>
- Li, X., & Chan, M. (2017). Comparing social media use, discussion, political trust and political engagement among university students in China and Hong Kong: An application of the O-S-R-O-R model. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 27(1), 65-81.
- Maziashvili, M., Pleśniak, A., & Kowalik, I. (2022). The digital communication tools and citizens' relationship with local governments: A comparison of Georgian and Polish cities. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 89(2), 555-576. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00208523221079746>

- Mostafa, M. M. (2020). Global halal food discourse on social media: A text mining approach. *Journal of International Communication*, 26(2), 211-237. <https://doi.org/m6qh>
- Purwadi, A., Pratama, A. B., & Mahendrati, R. M. (2019). Mengukur engagement warga negara dalam interaksi media sosial (Studi pada 32 akun resmi Facebook Pemerintah Kabupaten/Kota di Jawa Tengah). *Jurnal Natapraja*, 7(1), 1-7. <https://doi.org/m6qj>
- Ramanair, J. (2020). Media consumption and civic engagement: The reasoned action theory as a way forward to determine the relationship. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 36(1). <https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2020-3601-13>
- Rexhepi, A., Filiposka, S., & Trajkovik, V. (2021). Adoption of social networks as Web 2.0 citizen engagement tool in the local e-government context. *International Journal of Electronic Governance*, 13(1), 224-247. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJEG.2021.114276>
- Santoso, A. D., Rinjany, D. K., & Bafadhal, O. M. (2020). Social media and local government in Indonesia: Adoption, use and stakeholder engagement. *Romanian Journal of Communication and Public Relations*, 22(3), 21–35. <https://doi.org/kdnw>
- Sobaci, M. Z. (2015). *Social media and local governments: Theory and practice* (Vol. 15). Springer.
- Soon, C., & Soh, Y. Da. (2014). Engagement@web 2.0 between the government and citizens in Singapore: Dialogic communication on Facebook? *Asian Journal of Communication*, 24(1), 42–59. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01292986.2013.851722>
- Su, L., & Li, X. (2023). The effects of message attributes and source characteristics of news posts on audience engagement on social media. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 33(4), 390–408. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01292986.2023.2200435>
- Villodre, J., & Criado, J. I. (2020, June). Analyzing social media institutionalization in public administration. The role of inhibitors in local governments. *Proceedings of the 21st Annual International Conference on Digital Government Research*, 31-40. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3396956.3396984>
- Villodre, J., Criado, J. I., Meijer, A., & Liarte, I. (2021). Organizational models for social media institutionalization: An exploratory analysis of Dutch local governments. *Information Polity*, 26(4), 355-373. <https://doi.org/10.3233/IP-210316>
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research design and methods* (5th ed.). SAGE.
- Yoon, G., Li, C., Ji, Y. (Grace), North, M., Hong, C., & Liu, J. (2018). Attracting comments: Digital engagement metrics on Facebook and financial performance. *Journal of Advertising*, 47(1), 24-37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2017.1405753>