

## Corporate Crime In The Pharmaceutical Industry: Why We Must Be Concerned

AZLINDA ABDUL SAMAD\*  
ABDUL SAMAD ABDUL GHANI

### ABSTRACT

*The impact of corporate crime is wide and varies. This study intends to highlight on this, from the perspective of the pharmaceutical industry. This study is conducted by using a semi-structured interview question. Information is also collected from books, journals, reports, websites etc. The objective of this study is to determine the impacts of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry and provides some suggestion to overcome the issues. Corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry is an issue of concern because of its impact, especially on public safety and health, as it may lead to serious cases of permanent disability and fatality. Additionally, it can lead to other serious issues including the diversion of prescription medicine for non-medical or illicit use. It may also hamper the nation with the issue of drug problems which will consequently, affect the family institution as well as the society at large. The health system may also be affected due to the unsafe use of medicinal products and unethical practices among health professionals and personnel. Consumers or patients may also be exposed to untruthful and inaccurate drug advertisements and information. The crime has a negative impact on the pharmaceutical company itself and may tarnish the country's name and reputation. To overcome and stop corporate crime, requires cooperation and commitment from various entity. Holistic actions and approaches need to be taken to dealt with the issue immediately so it does not get worse.*

*Keywords: Corporate crime; pharmaceutical industry; public safety; unsafe medicines; drug advertisements.*

### INTRODUCTION

The pharmaceutical industry or sometimes called the Pharma industry has unique characteristics which makes it different from other industries. This industry is known to the public as the industry responsible in the making of medicines for human wellbeing and health. Sadly, over the years this industry has involved itself greatly in corporate crime. Study showed that corporate criminality of big pharma had become much worse.<sup>1</sup> This industry has been subjected to criticism as practicing placing revenue ahead of patient welfare.<sup>2</sup>

The topic of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry has been discussed for some time. Even today, there are still discussions going on about this topic. Professor John Braithwaite studied this industry, and documented it in his famous book entitled *Corporate Crime in the Pharmaceutical Industry* in 1984. In the context of his study on pharmaceutical industry, Braithwaite defined corporate crime as conduct of a corporation, or of employees acting on behalf of a corporation, which is proscribed and punishable by law.<sup>3</sup> The conduct could be punishable by imprisonment, probation, fine, revocation of licence, community service order, internal discipline order or other court-imposed penalties.<sup>4</sup>

After Braithwaite, many scholars did a study on the same industry and found that there is not much improvement ever since<sup>5,6</sup>. There are still cases of corporate crime in this industry<sup>7</sup> and even has come to the stage of being an organised crime.<sup>8</sup> Cases of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry are best described and discuss by looking at some of the real cases that had happened. Many cases involving the pharmaceutical industry have been documented in literature or bound into books. Some of these cases which have occurred are discussed here to aid and facilitate the discussion.

Compared to Malaysia, in general, cases of corporate crime in Malaysia are in increasing pattern.<sup>9</sup> Corporate crime has a wide impact on society, nation and state considering that the corporation play an important role in the country's economy.<sup>10</sup> From the literature search, local study of the impacts of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry, is limited, hence this study intends to highlight on this topic.

### OBJECTIVE

The objective of this study is to determine the impacts of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry and provides some suggestion to overcome the issues.

## METHODOLOGY

This study combined both doctrinal and non-doctrinal research method. The use of non-doctrinal method, allows the researcher to understand the respondents' thoughts on the issue discussed and at the same time, the respondents able to express and share their thoughts, beliefs and experiences etc.<sup>11</sup> This method was chosen in this study as this study wish to highlight on the impact of the crime or impact of the illegal activities that took place. By using this method, it allows data to be collected from the field in order to give more realistic and social input in legal research.<sup>12</sup> The data in this study was collected via interview by using a semi-structured interview question.

As for the doctrinal method, information is gathered from the literature review which included journals, books, newspaper articles and reports which were used to support the discussion. Additionally, information was also gathered from the official websites of government organisations as well as industrial establishments. Some cases that happened before were used to facilitate the discussion.

The sample size in this study is rather small. Respondents are from the pharmaceutical industry and from the government establishment. The total number of respondents agreed to be interviewed were four. The indepth interview conducted do not intend in making generalisation statement to a larger population of interest and does not tend to rely on hypothesis testing but rather is more inductive and emergent in its process.<sup>13</sup> Hence, the number of respondents in this study is small as this study merely intended to get the respondents to share information and knowledge on the topic discussed. All information gathered was transcribed manually using MS Word.

## THE STORY OF PHARMA SCANDALS

Before debating on the impact of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry, it is easier to start the discussion by looking at some of the actual cases of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry that have occurred and reported in real life. Many cases involving the pharmaceutical industry have been documented in literature or bound into books. Summaries of some of these cases are discussed here to aid and facilitate the discussion.

## THE THALIDOMIDE TRAGEDY

Thalidomide was the active substance of a drug called *Contergan*<sup>®</sup>. It was introduced and marketed by a German company, Chemie Grünenthal.<sup>14</sup> In 1957, this drug was released into the market as an over-the-counter drug<sup>15</sup>, accessible without prescription and also relatively inexpensive.<sup>16</sup> The drug thalidomide was introduced to control nausea during several weeks of pregnancy.<sup>17</sup> Chemie Grünenthal, aggressively advertised this drug as a safe and non-toxic tranquilizer with no side effects.<sup>18</sup>

Sometime in 1961, there were reports that indicated taking this drug during pregnancy causes severe deformities in the foetus.<sup>19</sup> At least over 10,000 babies were confirmed to suffer from severe congenital defects in many organs, including limbs, face, eyes, ears, external genitalia, vertebrae, heart, kidney, and gut.<sup>20</sup>

The company is aware of the effects of thalidomide but deny the link between thalidomide and birth defects until later, thalidomide was confirmed by two independent clinicians, Lenz in Germany and McBride in Australia, to be the cause of severe birth defects in children.<sup>21</sup> In addition, there were reports of increased miscarriage rates during this period.<sup>22</sup> Thalidomide finally was withdrawn worldwide in 1962.<sup>23</sup>

## THE TAMIFLU CRISIS

An outbreak of febrile respiratory infection was detected in Mexico way back in March 2009. In April 2009, cases were also reported in the USA and novel swine-origin influenza A (H1N1) virus (S-OIV) was identified.<sup>24</sup> On 24 April 2009, World Health Organization (WHO) declared the outbreak a Public Health Emergency of International Concern (PHEIC).<sup>25</sup> Based on the recommendation of the Emergency Committee, the Director-General of WHO raised the pandemic level to phases 4, 5 and subsequently to 6.<sup>26</sup> In just a nine-week period, the outbreak has been reported from all WHO Regions.<sup>27</sup>

There was no vaccine at that point in time. However, one of the drugs which claimed to be effective for the treatment was oseltamivir (Tamiflu). In conjunction with the outbreak, the WHO encouraged states to stockpile the medication. Among others, claims by Roche that the drug reduced hospitalisations and serious complications of flu were a key factor underlying the stockpiling decisions.<sup>28</sup> Earlier, the US Food and Drug Administration

(USFDA) approved Tamiflu the brand of oseltamivir in 1999. Oseltamivir is a neuraminidase inhibitor and it is used to treat influenza.<sup>29</sup> This product is produced by a well-known pharmaceutical company; Roche who also owns the patent it.

At the initial stage, results of the randomised control trials, systematic review and meta-analysis confirmed the efficacy and safety of oseltamivir. However, the majority of the results came from the study funded by Roche itself.<sup>30</sup> In 2009, a Cochrane review team took almost 4 years to assemble around 150,000 pages of clinical trial data, most of which had never been made public.<sup>31</sup> The results of the analysis of the data showed oseltamivir increases the risk of adverse effects, such as nausea, vomiting, psychiatric effects and renal events in adults and vomiting in children.<sup>32</sup> The Cochrane findings proved that there are many shortcomings and Roche over emphasised the benefits of oseltamivir and underplayed the harms of it.<sup>33</sup> Many countries stockpile the drug and Roche make a huge profits.<sup>34</sup>

#### THE PAXIL SCANDAL

Paxil is the brand name of the generic drug paroxetine.<sup>35</sup> It is an antidepressant and is normally prescribed in the treatment of the major depressive disorder.<sup>36</sup> It is a selective serotonin reuptake inhibitor class.<sup>37</sup> Paxil was marketed and sold by GlaxoSmithKline (GSK).<sup>38</sup>

The issue with Paxil is that GSK unlawfully promoted Paxil for treating depression in patients under the age of 18<sup>39</sup> and Food Drug Administration (FDA) has never approved it for pediatric use.<sup>40</sup> GSK was found participating in preparing, publishing and distributing a misleading medical journal article that misreported that a clinical trial of Paxil demonstrated efficacy in the treatment of depression in patients under the age of 18, when in actual fact the study failed to demonstrate efficacy.<sup>41</sup>

At the same time, GSK did not make data available from two other studies in which Paxil also failed to demonstrate efficacy in treating depression in patients under 18.<sup>42</sup> GSK also founded sponsored dinner programs, lunch programs, spa programs and similar activities to promote the use of Paxil in children and adolescents.<sup>43</sup> The company was also found to have paid speakers to talk to an audience of doctors and paid for the meal or spa treatments for the doctors who attended.<sup>44</sup> Despite the ineffectiveness of the drug, GSK continued by hiring a contractor to write favourable article about Paxil.<sup>45</sup>

## FINDINGS

### THE IMPACT OF CORPORATE CRIME IN THE PHARMA INDUSTRY AND WHY MUST WE BE CONCERNED ABOUT IT

Cases of drug catastrophes as discussed in the earlier paragraph, are just a few of the examples of corporate crime that really occurred in the real world. As seen from the three examples above, the main issue of concerns is the safety and the effectiveness of the drug. These two aspects cannot be compromised as their impacts on the public or on patients are great. Not just that, there are some other consequences of corporate crime covering the impacts on the pharmaceutical industry itself, communities and society and this is shared by one of the respondents as below:

*“Banyak kesan-kesan yang buruk kepada industri sendiri, kepada komuniti dan masyarakat secara keseluruhan”.*  
[Many bad effects to the industry itself, to the community and society as a whole].

From the examples of the cases discussed earlier, it is apparent that the impact of the crime which is of great concern is on health. The number one concern is the safety of the medication itself when it is consumed. Safety is a concern because of its impact on human health conditions, in particular those medicines that do not meet the standard specifications. The impact on health sometimes can appear in short term where patients may suffer from the side effects of the medication they consumed and this is explained by the respondents:

*“Produk-produk yang tidak memenuhi spek dan perkara-perkara yang boleh menjejaskan kesihatan apa lagi barangkali... diambil secara berterusan”.*  
[Products which do not meet the specification can affect health if taken continuously].

*“Kesan jangka pendeknya kesan-kesan sampingan ubat yang masyarakat dapat”.*  
[The short-term effects are the side effects of drugs that the community can get].

Following up on the drug safety issues and their impacts on the health condition, the worst-case scenario of why we should be concerned about the impact of corporate crime in this industry is that, the impact of the medicines produced and consumed, may lead to permanent disabilities or even death. Talking about death, comparing to street crime, corporate crime claimed more lives.<sup>46</sup> In this

scenario, there is no way to reverse the condition or the loss suffered by the poor victims. The example of cases recorded in the literature is in the case of Thalidomide where it was found that Thalidomide is the major cause of phocomelia.<sup>47</sup> The respondent highlighted concerns on this issue as follows:

*"Mungkin akan mengakibatkan kematian ataupun kecederaan kekal, lumpuh dan sebagainya".*  
[May results in death or permanent injury, paralysis and so on]

As the producer of medicinal products which are essential, it is important for the pharmaceutical industry to ensure, that their industry able to produce medicinal products which are of quality, safety and efficacious. Therefore, morally, any illegal activities should not take place in the industry. Unfortunately, corporate criminality of big pharma had become much worse.<sup>48</sup> Study showed that pharmaceutical industry has a bad reputation and cannot be trusted to do the right thing.<sup>49</sup> This finding is consistent with the explanation received from the respondent. The respondent explained as below:

*"Jika ini berlaku, maknanya industri ini...tidak boleh diharapkan ataupun tidak boleh kita bergantung kepada mereka".*  
[If this happens, it means that this industry cannot be relied upon, nor can we depend on them].

In the long term, if this continues, the public may not trust this industry anymore. This may have an impact on the health system as a whole. Public confidence in the health system can be undermined. If it is not curbed, public and community confidence is not restored, over time they can turn to other alternative forms of treatment and medicines. These are explained by the respondents as:

*"Kesan jangka panjang sistem kesihatan kita memang akan huru hara juga".*  
[Long-term effects, our health system will be in chaos as well]

*"Dalam jangka masa panjang mereka akan mengatakan iaitu, kalau macam ini...saya akan beralihlah kepada ubatan tradisional atau pun...perubatan tradisional dan sebagainya".*  
[In a long term they will say that, if this is the case, I will switch to traditional medicine or even traditional treatment and others].

The pharmaceutical industry spends a lot of money on its promotional and advertising activities. Advertisement is among the tool to convince public to purchase the medicines. In Malaysia, advertisement of medicinal product is subjected to the approval from the Medicine Advertisements Board (MAB), prior to advertise. Section 4B of the Medicines (Advertisement and Sale) Act 1956, reads:

"No person shall take part in the publication of any advertisement referring to any article or articles of any description, in terms which are calculated to lead to the use of that article or articles of that description as a medicine, an appliances or remedy for the purpose of treatment or prevention of diseases or conditions of human beings other than the disease and conditions specified in Section 3(1) unless such advertisement has been approved by the Medicine Advertisements Board."

What is worrying is, when the advertisement contents disseminate information which is not approved by the authority or without correct information on the side effects and contraindications. There is a possible risk of harming patients without proper and correct information. From the three examples of cases discussed earlier, it is very clear how the industry makes use of aggressive promotions to promote their products including making false claims in terms of product safety and effectiveness.

This kind of approach is also seen in the case of a drug called Vioxx. The company provided unreliable product information, applied deceptive promotional practices and fabricated medical journal studies to enhance Vioxx's credibility.<sup>50</sup> Studies at a later stage found that the drug can increase the risk of cardiovascular events, such as heart attack or stroke.<sup>51</sup> In the context of medicines advertisements, respondents claimed that their concerns are, the impact on the public at large, in terms of the contents and information disseminated to the public. Respondents stated that:

*"Jadi bila mengiklankan kepada public...akan menjejaskan sendiri industri itu dan nampak macam...pihak industri sendiri menghalalkan perkara-perkara dan fakta-fakta penipuan".*  
[So, when advertising to the public, it will affect the industry itself and it looks like the industry itself legitimizes the fraudulent things and facts].

*"Jadi saya tidak rasa itu satu perkara yang healthy. Tidak bagus untuk kita memberitahu, kita educate the public...dengan fakta-fakta salah".*  
[So, I don't think that's a healthy thing. It is not good for us to inform, educate the public with the wrong facts].

*"Pengiklanan yang dashyat boleh menarik orang. Pengiklanan tanpa kelulusan Lembaga Iklan Ubat dan sebagainya. Jadi... orang akan beli, orang akan tertumpu kepada produk daripada company itu sahaja".*  
[Aggressive advertising can attract people. Advertising without the approval of the Medicines Advertisements Board and so on. So, people will buy, people will focus on products from that company only].

*“Suplemen atau pun tradisional dan lain-lain yang ada di pasaran...membuat tuntutan perubatan yang bukan-bukan”.*  
[Supplements, traditional medicines and others that are on the market make medical claims that are nonsense].

*“So benda itu tidak sepatutnya terjadi sebab...akan mengelirukan dan...tidak membantu kesihatan masyarakat sebenarnya”.*  
[So, that thing should not happen because it will be confusing and not really helping the health of the community].

An excellent reputation for industry is necessary to ensure excellence and to enable the industry to be trusted. With reference to the pharmaceutical industry, a good reputation is important because this industry produces medicines that are an essential need for patients. When the industry is caught up in corporate crime, the direct effect is that it has a negative impact on the reputation itself. Some punitive actions may be imposed on them which may directly have an impact on the product they produced. The worst-case scenario, may result in the closure of the pharmaceutical company itself. This is highlighted by the respondents as follows:

*“Kalau kita tengok reputasi itu katakanlah aktiviti tidak beretika company itu dapat dikesan atau dihidu oleh penguatkuasa... mungkin kalau ada dibuktikan cukup elemen untuk pendakwaan semua, mungkin akan berlaku apa-apa tindakan punitif kepada company itu. Contohnya tarik balik lesen yang berkaitan... dengan produk-produk yang biasa untuk company itu”.*

[If we look at the reputation, let's say, the unethical activities of the company can be detected or smelled by the law enforcement, maybe if there are enough elements proven for prosecution, there might be some punitive action against the company. For example, revoke the licence related to products that are common to the company].

*“Bila dicekup oleh penguatkuasa, company mungkin boleh ditutup kerana melanggar apa-apa akta dan pertubuhan syarikat”.*

[When caught by the enforcement, the company may be closed for violating any act and company organisation].

Some of the medicines being produced may be exported and consumed globally. If there is a case of death following the use of a particular medicine, the good image of the country indirectly may be affected. If this situation happened, it is not healthy and may have implications where, investors will not be keen and interested in investing in the country. Indirectly it can cause losses in the economic aspect. This is highlighted by the respondent as follows:

*“Tapi yang lebih serius bila ia ke arah global. Contohnya katakanlah...dicampur palsu dan ada kematian pengguna. Orang menggunakan ia dan berlaku kematian. Jadi benda itu akan ke arah global...seluruh dunia tahu dan melibatkan reputasi negara juga”.*

[But what is more serious when it goes global. People use it and die. The whole world knows and it involves the country's reputation as well].

From the economic perspective, large pharmaceutical companies pay taxes. Countries get revenue from the tax imposed. Despite committing a corporate crime, at the same time, these giant companies sponsor various events and make contributions or donations as a way to portray their corporate and social responsibility. Though this may sound improper, indirectly many parties do benefit from it. On this point, respondents stated:

*“Syarikat farmaseutikal yang besar, mereka telah memenuhi syarat-syarat yang ditetapkan oleh kerajaan dengan membayar cukai dengan CSR corporate social responsibility yang mereka amalkan”.*

[Giant pharmaceutical companies, they have met the conditions set by the government by paying taxes and corporate social responsibility they practice]

*“Mereka menaja event-event ataupun...mereka melaksanakan perkara-perkara untuk kemaslahatan umum, walaupun mereka berselindung di sebalik apa yang mereka lakukan...yang tidak beretika itu”.*

[They sponsor event or they carry out things for the public good, even though they hide behind the unethical thing they do].

Another effect of this crime that we should be concerned about is, the misuse of drug. An example of a case that was documented was observed in the case of OxyContin<sup>®</sup>. OxyContin<sup>®</sup> is a prescription medication. In this case, health and medical personnel were directly involved in these unethical practices<sup>52</sup> and at the same time, their practices somehow giving a bad impression of the health system.

Malaysia also faced the issue of misuse of medicines for non-medical use. According to the Malaysia National Anti-Drug Agency (NADA) from 2016 to 2020, besides narcotic substances, few psychotropic substances were found either being abuse or misuse and it includes psychotropic substances such as benzodiazepine and Eramin 5.<sup>53</sup> From the statistics the main reasons for abuse or misuse is due to non-medical reasons which include peer influence, curiosity, and for fun.<sup>54</sup> Respondents raised their concern regarding psychotropic substances and explained as below:

*“Ada produk-produk yang di jual, disalahgunakan. Ubat-ubatan yang telah diedarkan di pasaran disalah guna. Sebagai contohnya ubat batuk yang boleh membuatkan khayal... disalahgunakan bukannya untuk kebaikan”.*

[There are products that are sold that may be misused. The drugs were distributed on the misuse market. For example, cough medicine that can make you hallucinate is misused instead of for good].

*“Tidak mengawal selia rekod-rekod atau pembekalan bahan psikotropik, bahan racun dan ada juga yang bukan untuk tujuan rawatan penyakit pun dibekalkan”.*

[Not regulating the records of the supply of psychotropic substances, poisonous substance and some that are not even for the purpose of disease treatment are supplied]

*“Concern sekarang ialah bahan psikotropik...sebab kesan advers dari bahan psikotropik memang boleh memberi kesan yang sangat negatif kepada pengguna”.*

[The current concern is psychotropic substances because the adverse effects of psychotropic substances can have a very negative effect on users].

Drug abuse or misuse may cause harm not only to the individual, but also to the people surrounding the individual as well. It is also morally understood, that it is legally wrong to be involved in activities such as drug abuse or misuse.

## SUGGESTION

Accordingly, the issue of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry cannot be allowed to continue because the impact of this crime is very broad and serious. As a way forward, to tackle the issue, holistic approaches, practical measures and prompt actions indeed is needed. In this matter, respondents suggested that the measures should begin with education as early as possible. Education, among other should emphasise on the importance of being ethical in any matter that we do. These are explained by the respondents as below:

*“...kita kena mulakan dia daripada awal...seawal pendidikan kepada pelajar-pelajar iaitu pentingnya beretika di dalam melakukan perkara-perkara...yang penting untuk kemaslahatan umum...”*

[...we have to start from the beginning, as early as education for the students, which is the importance of being ethical in doing things which are important for the common good...].

*“...kita kena didik daripada sekolah ke universiti dan seterusnya sampai bila-bila pun. Apabila generasi yang seterusnya dan mereka ada di dalam industri itu sekarang...harus diberikan penekanan didikan dan beretika...”*

[...we have to educate from school to university and at any time. When the next generation is in the industry, education and ethics should be emphasised...].

Besides producing medicines for the wellbeing and health of the public or patient, it is understood that pharmaceutical industry is part of a business entity. It is well understood that morally in doing business, good ethics is important not just for the company but also for the benefits of the stakeholders. A good ethics will differentiate what is right to do and what is wrong to do.

Corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry is like a harmful disease that need to be treated seriously. To treat this particular disease, the remedy requires the involvement and commitment from each party, particularly when this crime has a negative impact on the society, especially when the impact is associated with safety of the public at large. This matter is explained by the respondents as follows:

*“...perkara-perkara itu perlu diambil serius oleh segala agensi yang berkaitan...”*

[...those matters need to be taken seriously by all relevant agencies...].

*“...segala pihak perlu bertanggungjawab, segala pihak perlu merasakan ini adalah tanggungjawab mereka...untuk keperluan umum, keperluan masyarakat Malaysia...”*

[all parties need to be responsible; all parties need to feel that this is their responsibility for the general needs, the needs of Malaysian society...].

*“...untuk kita tangani benda ni as a whole. Kita tak boleh silo...”*

[...for us to dealt with the matter as a whole. We cannot work in silos...].

*“...so kalau kita memang nak komprehensif, menyeluruh...holistic benda tu yang kita boleh buat, kita boleh kawal ataupun kita boleh kekang dia memang kena work together, sinergi sama-sama dari setiap bahagian...”*

[...so, if we really want to be comprehensive...holistic, the things we can do, we can control or we can curb, we really have to work together, synergy from every division...].

It's common in business no one wants to lose. In order to achieve profit, consumer's and patient's demand need to be taken into account. On the other hand, being a customer, a consumer or a patient, needs to ensure the demands and needs are genuine and for the right cause. The demand somehow will guide the pharmaceutical industry in their production and marketing strategy. Consumers need to be smart, and the industry should not abuse the demand just for the sake of making profit.

In this matter, consumer right and power are the strongest weapon to give pressure to the industry. Consumer can contribute as an eye and ear monitoring the industry. In that way perhaps, the industry can be more transparent and indirectly may

avoid and stop the issue of corporate crime. This is shared by the respondent as below:

“...yang penting pada saya ...berkenaan dengan demand dan supply chain...kalau pengguna tak ada demand company tak boleh nak supply sebab nanti buat rugi dia je...

[...what is important to me...regarding demand and supply chain...if the user does not have demand, the company cannot supply because he will lose...].

“...kuasa pengguna adalah kuasa terbesar. Sebab tu pentingnya pendidikan pengguna...

[...consumer power is the greatest power. That's why consumer education is important...].

“...mungkin boleh cuba...mencegah dari dalaman company tu sendiri. Macam kita boleh...lantik satu jawatankuasa ataupun terdiri daripada persatuan pengguna...sebagai auditor kepada company tu sendiri...macam audit yang lebih transparent yang terdiri daripada persatuan pengguna tu sendiri...

[...maybe we can try to prevent it from within the company itself. Like appoint a committee made up from consumer associations...as auditors...a more transparent audit made up of consumer associations...].

Ultimately, government and pharmaceutical association also have important role to play. As understood, government enforces the laws and regulations. As part of the social responsibility towards the stakeholders, as well as to ensure governance among the stakeholders, the government may conduct education and awareness activities on corporate crime issues as a medium to remind and update the industry. The association on the other hand, besides focussing on the business matters, association matters, should spend some time doing research for example to improvise the pharmaceutical industry to a better level with good governance. This is highlighted by the respondent as follows:

[...for government wise of course I think...do some more awareness...on this corporate crime...these are still lacking...].

[...the association they should basically do more data collection, do some studies... Don't look into business perspective alone...].

## CONCLUSION

The impact of corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry is vast, varied and involved many aspects. The most important concern is, its impact on public health and safety. Consumers or patients are the groups that will be affected the most by this crime. Corporate crimes by the pharmaceutical industry may also lead to the emergence of other more serious crimes and in the long run, may

lead to some other social problems in the society. There are also concerns regarding the unethical practices among the professionals and the industry players themselves. It can also cause the country's health system to be affected and not trusted. The pharmaceutical company's reputation itself can be affected. Country's reputation and good name may be tarnished. Hence, for all these reasons, corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry is an issue of serious concern and needs to be addressed expeditiously. As a way forward, reasonable measures, holistic actions and approaches need to be taken so that it does not spread. Every entity being the policy maker, the industry itself, associations even the consumers have an important role to play and contribute.

## NOTES

- <sup>1</sup> J. Braithwaite, 'Regulatory mix, collective efficacy, and crimes of the powerful', (2020) 1(1) *Journal of White Collar and Corporate Crime*, p 67.
- <sup>2</sup> D.G. Arnold, L.H. Amato, J.L. Troyer, & O.J. Stewart, 'Innovation and misconduct in the pharmaceutical industry', (2022) 144 *Journal of Business Research*, p 1052.
- <sup>3</sup> J. Braithwaite, *Corporate crime in the pharmaceutical industry*. Routledge & Kegan Paul, London, 2013, p 6.
- <sup>4</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>5</sup> C. Davis, & J. Abraham, 'Is there a cure for corporate crime in the drug industry?' (2013) 346 (f755) *British Medical Journal*, p 1.
- <sup>6</sup> P.C. Gøtzsche, *Deadly Medicines and Organised Crime: How Big Pharma has Corrupted Healthcare*, CRC Press, New York, 2013, p 32.
- <sup>7</sup> P.C. Gøtzsche, 'Big pharma often commits corporate crime, and this must be stopped', (2012) 345(e8462) *British Medical Journal*, p 1.
- <sup>8</sup> E. McCarthy, 'A call to prosecute drug company fraud as organized crime', (2019), 69 (439) *Syracuse L. Rev.* p442.
- <sup>9</sup> M. Fahim, & H. Kabir, 'Exploring the threats of corporate crime as a rising trend of white-collar crime in Bangladesh: An empirical study in the light of Criminal Law', (2021), 6(1) *Journal of Asia Pacific Studies*, p 32.
- <sup>10</sup> S. Candra, 'Beneficial owner criminal liability for corporate crimes in the environment sector', (2020), 2(3), *International Journal of Research in Commerce and Management Studies*, p 43.
- <sup>11</sup> S.C. Shaari, N. A. K.N. Mahmud & F. B. S. Baig, 'A non-doctrinal study on the implementation of occupational safety and health (OSH) legislation in manufacturing small and medium enterprises (SMEs) of Sabah', (2020). *Asian Journal of Entrepreneurship*, 1(4) *Asian Journal of Entrepreneurship*, p 17.
- <sup>12</sup> M. S. Afolayan, & O. A. Oniyinde 'Interviews and questionnaires as legal research instruments' (2019) 83 *JL Pol'y & Globalization*, p 51.
- <sup>13</sup> S. L. Dworkin, 'Sample size policy for qualitative studies using in-depth interviews' (2012) 41 *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, p 1319.

- <sup>14</sup> V. Mhatre, L.K. Vyas, & D.K. Bharati, 'Rebirth of thalidomide', (2022) 11(7) *World Journal of Pharmaceutical Research*, p 842.
- <sup>15</sup> K. Yashiro, S. Miyagawa, & Y. Sawa, 'A lesson from the thalidomide tragedy—The past is never dead. It's not even past. William Faulkner, from requiem for a nun', (2018) 82(9), *Circulation Journal*, p 2250.
- <sup>16</sup> V. Mhatre, L.K. Vyas, & D.K. Bharati, 'Rebirth of thalidomide', (2022) 11(7) *World Journal of Pharmaceutical Research*, p 843.
- <sup>17</sup> I. N. P. B. Rumiarta, & A. A. S. N. Indradewi, 'The concept of consumer protection: An international cultural perspective', (2020) 2(02) *The International Journal of Language and Cultural (TIJOLAC)*, p 53.
- <sup>18</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>19</sup> W.H. Schneider, 'The Establishment of Institutional Review Boards in the US Background History' 2021, [https://scholarworks.iupui.edu/bitstream/handle/1805/27399/Schneider\\_IRBHistory.pdf?sequence=2](https://scholarworks.iupui.edu/bitstream/handle/1805/27399/Schneider_IRBHistory.pdf?sequence=2) [12 November 2022].
- <sup>20</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>21</sup> I.A. Zabeen, & M.M. H. Zubaida Khatun, 'Comparative study on strategies for the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of birth defects' (2020) 9(2) *The Pharma Innovation Journal*, p 74.
- <sup>22</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>23</sup> K. Hussain, P. Patel, & N. Roberts. 'The role of thalidomide in dermatology', (2022) 47(4) *Clinical and Experimental Dermatology*, p 667
- <sup>24</sup> Novel Swine-Origin Influenza A (H1N1) Virus Investigation Team. 'Emergence of a novel swine-origin influenza A (H1N1) virus in humans', (2009) 360(25), *New England Journal of Medicine*, p 2605.
- <sup>25</sup> World Health Organization Regional Office for South-East Asia, 'Pandemic H1N1 2009 Report of Regional Consultation on Pandemic H1N1 2009 and Strengthening Country Capacity for Pandemic Preparedness', 2009, <https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/205605/B4399.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> [1 December 2022]
- <sup>26</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>27</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>28</sup> A. Vilhelmsson, & S. Mulinari, 'Pharmaceutical lobbying and pandemic stockpiling: A feeling of déjà vu in the Nordic countries and why the sociological perspective is crucial to understand COVID-19', (2020) 63(4) *Acta Sociologica*, p 441.
- <sup>29</sup> Anon, 'Highlights of Prescribing Information', United States Food and Drug Administration, 2012, [https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/drugsatfda\\_docs/label/2012/021087s0621bl.pdf](https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/drugsatfda_docs/label/2012/021087s0621bl.pdf) [30 August 2022].
- <sup>30</sup> Y.K. Gupta, M. Meenu, & P. Mohan, 'The Tamiflu fiasco and lessons learnt', (2015) 47(1) *Indian Journal of Pharmacology*, p 11.
- <sup>31</sup> T. Jefferson, M.A. Jones, P. Doshi, C. B. Del Mar, R. Hama, M. J. Thompson, & C. J. Heneghan, 'Neuraminidase inhibitors for preventing and treating influenza in adults and children', (2014) (4) *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, p 2.
- <sup>32</sup> Ibid
- <sup>33</sup> Y.K. Gupta, M. Meenu, & P. Mohan, 'The Tamiflu fiasco and lessons learnt', (2015) 47(1) *Indian Journal of Pharmacology*, p 13.
- <sup>34</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>35</sup> MedicalNewsToday, 'What to Know About Paxil (Paroxetine)', 2019, <https://www.medicalnewstoday.com/articles/325996> [31 December 2022].
- <sup>36</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>37</sup> R.M. Nevels, S.T. Gontkovsky, & B.E. Williams, 'Paroxetine-The Antidepressant from Hell? Probably Not, But Caution Required', (2016) 46(1) *Psychopharmacology Bulletin*, p 78.
- <sup>38</sup> S. Mulinari, & P. Ozieranski, 'Capitalizing on transparency: commercial surveillance and pharmaceutical marketing after the Physician Sunshine Act', (2022) 9(1) *Big Data & Society*, p 5.
- <sup>39</sup> L.M. Csorba, 'Drugs consumer protection â€“a socio-economic point of view regarding drugs safety', (2020) (2) *Economic Alternatives*, p 264.
- <sup>40</sup> The United States Department of Justice, 'GlaxoSmithKline to Plead Guilty and Pay \$3 Billion to Resolve Fraud Allegations and Failure to Report Safety Data', 2012, <https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/glaxosmithkline-plead-guilty-and-pay-3-billion-resolve-fraud-allegations-and-failure-report> [13 December 2022].
- <sup>41</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>42</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>43</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>44</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>45</sup> V. Luu, & M. Price, 'GlaxoSmithKline Health Care Fraud Settlement with the US Justice Department, 2012. Student Works', 2018, <https://repositories.lib.utexas.edu/bitstream/handle/2152/74966/EthicsReport2018-converted.pdf?sequence=2> [13 December 2022].
- <sup>46</sup> R. Alcadipani, & C.R. de Oliveira Medeiros, 'When corporations cause harm: A critical view of corporate social irresponsibility and corporate crimes', (2020) 167(2) *Journal of Business Ethics*, p 285.
- <sup>47</sup> H. Sjoostrom, & R. Nilsson, *Thalidomide and the Power of the Drugs Company*, Penguins Books Ltd, England, 1972, p 104.
- <sup>48</sup> J. Braithwaite, 'Regulatory mix, collective efficacy, and crimes of the powerful', (2020) 1(1) *Journal of White Collar and Corporate Crime*, p 67.
- <sup>49</sup> A. Laskai, 'Undue Pharmaceutical Industry Influence in Medical Profession. In Institutional Corruption Theory in Pharmaceutical Industry-Medicine Relationships', (2020) 19 Springer, Cham, p 17.
- <sup>50</sup> S. Van Schaik, & A. Bonomi, 'Evaluation: From Policy to Practice', SUSTAINALYTICS, 2019, <https://www.dr-rath-foundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Evaluation-Report-From-Policy-to-Practice.pdf> [10 December 2022].
- <sup>51</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>52</sup> Anon, '5 Doctors among 10 Arrested in New York City, Westchester Prescription Drug Bust', Eyewitness News ABC7, 2018, <https://abc7ny.com/staten-island-new-york-city-oxycodone-drug-bust/4461710/> [15 August 2022].
- <sup>53</sup> National Anti-Drug Agency, 'Statistic trend of number of drug addicts detected according to type of drugs, 2016-2020', 2023, <https://www.adk.gov.my/en/statistic-trend-of-number-of-drug-addicts-detected-according-to-type-of-drugs-2016-2020/> [23 January 2023].
- <sup>54</sup> National Anti-Drug Agency, 'Statistic trend of number of drug addicts detected according to reason of taking drugs, 2016 – 2020', 2023, <https://www.adk.gov.my/en/statistic-trend-of-number-of-drug-addicts-detected-according-to-reason-of-taking-drugs-2016-2020/> [23 January 2023].



## REFERENCES

- Alcadipani, R., & de Oliveira Medeiros, C. R. 2020. When corporations cause harm: A critical view of corporate social irresponsibility and corporate crimes. *Journal of Business Ethics* 167(2): 285-297.
- Afolayan, M. S., & Oniyinde, O. A. 2019. Interviews and questionnaires as legal research instruments. *JL Pol'y & Globalization* 83: 51-59.
- Anon. 2012. Highlights of Prescribing Information. United States Food and Drug Administration. [https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/drugsatfda\\_docs/label/2012/021087s062lbl.pdf](https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/drugsatfda_docs/label/2012/021087s062lbl.pdf) [30 August 2022].
- Anon. 2018. 5 Doctors among 10 Arrested in New York City, Westchester Prescription Drug Bust. *Eyewitness News ABC7*. <https://abc7ny.com/staten-island-new-york-city-oxycodone-drug-bust/4461710/> [15 August 2022].
- Arnold, D. G., Amato, L. H., Troyer, J. L., & Stewart, O. J. 2022. Innovation and misconduct in the pharmaceutical industry. *Journal of Business Research* 144: 1052-1063.
- Braithwaite, J. 2013. *Corporate Crime in the Pharmaceutical Industry*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Braithwaite, J. 2020. Regulatory mix, collective efficacy, and crimes of the powerful. *Journal of White Collar and Corporate Crime* 1(1): 62-71.
- Candra, S. 2020. Beneficial owner criminal liability for corporate crimes in the environment sector. *International Journal of Research in Commerce and Management Studies* 2(3):38-50.
- Csorba, L. M. 2020. Drugs consumer protection – a socio-economic point of view regarding drugs safety. *Economic Alternatives* (2): 262-282.
- Davis, C., & Abraham, J. 2013. Is there a cure for corporate crime in the drug industry? *British Medical Journal* 346 (f755) *British Medical Journal*.
- Dworkin, S. L. 2012. Sample size policy for qualitative studies using in-depth interviews. *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 41: 1319-1320.
- Fahim, M., & Kabir, H. 2021. Exploring the threats of corporate crime as a rising trend of white-collar crime in Bangladesh: An empirical study in the light of Criminal Law. *Journal of Asia Pacific Studies* 6(1):23-38.
- Gotzsche, P. C. 2012. Big pharma often commits corporate crime, and this must be stopped. *British Medical Journal* 345(e8462).
- Gotzsche, P. C. 2013. *Deadly Medicines and Organised Crime: How Big Pharma has Corrupted Healthcare*. New York: CRC Press.
- Gupta, Y. K., Meenu, M., & Mohan, P. 2015. The Tamiflu fiasco and lessons learnt. *Indian Journal of Pharmacology* 47(1): 11-16.
- Hussain, K., Patel, P., & Roberts, N. 2022. The role of thalidomide in dermatology. *Clinical and Experimental Dermatology* 47(4): 667-674.
- Jefferson, T., Jones, M. A., Doshi, P., Del Mar, C. B., Hama, R., Thompson, M. J., & Heneghan, C. J. 2014. Neuraminidase inhibitors for preventing and treating influenza in adults and children. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* (4).
- Laskai, A. 2020. Undue Pharmaceutical Industry Influence in Medical Profession. In Institutional Corruption Theory in Pharmaceutical Industry-Medicine Relationships. *Springer, Cham* 19: 17-48.
- Luu, V. & Price, M. 2018. GlaxoSmithKline Health Care Fraud Settlement with the US Justice Department, 2012. Student Works. <https://repositories.lib.utexas.edu/bitstream/handle/2152/74966/EthicsReport2018-converted.pdf?sequence=2> [13 December 2022].
- McCarthy, E. 2019. A call to prosecute drug company fraud as organized crime. *Syracuse L. Rev.* 69(439): 439-488
- Medicines (Advertisement and Sale) Act 1956 [Act 290]. *MedicalNewsToday*. 2019. What to Know About Paxil (Paroxetine). <https://www.medicalnewstoday.com/articles/325996> [31 December 2022].
- Mhatre, V., Vyas, L. K., & Bharati, D. K. 2022. Rebirth of thalidomide. *World Journal of Pharmaceutical Research* 11(7): 842-854.
- Mulinari, S., & Ozieranski, P. 2022. Capitalizing on transparency: commercial surveillance and pharmaceutical marketing after the Physician Sunshine Act. *Big Data & Society* 9(1):1-14.
- National Anti-Drug Agency. 2023. Statistic trend of number of drug addicts detected according to type of drugs, 2016-2020. <https://www.adk.gov.my/en/statistic-trend-of-number-of-drug-addicts-detected-according-to-type-of-drugs-2016-2020/> [23 January 2023].
- National Anti-Drug Agency. 2023. Statistic trend of number of drug addicts detected according to reason of taking drugs, 2016 – 2020', 2023, <https://www.adk.gov.my/en/statistic-trend-of-number-of-drug-addicts-detected-according-to-reason-of-taking-drugs-2016-2020/> [23 January 2023].
- Nevels, R. M., Gontkovsky, S. T., & Williams, B. E. 2016. Paroxetine-the antidepressant from hell? Probably not, but caution required. *Psychopharmacology Bulletin* 46(1): 77–104.
- Novel Swine-Origin Influenza A (H1N1) Virus Investigation Team. 2009. Emergence of a novel swine-origin influenza A (H1N1) virus in humans. *New England Journal of Medicine* 360(25): 2605-2615.
- Rumiarta, I. N. P. B., & Indradewi, A. A. S. N. 2020. The concept of consumer protection: An international cultural perspective. *The International Journal of Language and Cultural (TIJOLAC)* 2(02): 52-57.
- Schneider, W. H. 2021. The Establishment of Institutional Review Boards in the US Background History. [https://scholarworks.iupui.edu/bitstream/handle/1805/27399/Schneider\\_IRBHistory.pdf?sequence=2](https://scholarworks.iupui.edu/bitstream/handle/1805/27399/Schneider_IRBHistory.pdf?sequence=2) [12 November 2022].

- Shaari, S. C., Mahmud, N. A. K. N., & Baig, F. B. S. 2020. A non-doctrinal study on the implementation of occupational safety and health (OSH) legislation in manufacturing small and medium enterprises (SMEs) of Sabah. *Asian Journal of Entrepreneurship* 1(4): 11-26.
- Sjoostrom, H. & Nilsson, R. 1972. *Thalidomide and the Power of the Drugs Company*, England: Penguins Books Ltd.
- The United States Department of Justice. 2012. GlaxoSmithKline to Plead Guilty and Pay \$3 Billion to Resolve Fraud Allegations and Failure to Report Safety Data. <https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/glaxosmithkline-plead-guilty-and-pay-3-billion-resolve-fraud-allegations-and-failure-report> [13 December 2022].
- Van Schaik, S. & Bonomi, A. 2019. Evaluation: From Policy to Practice. *SUSTAINALYTICS*. <https://www.dr-rath-foundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Evaluation-Report-From-Policy-to-Practice.pdf> [10 December 2022].
- Vilhelmsson, A., & Mulinari, S. 2020. Pharmaceutical lobbying and pandemic stockpiling: A feeling of déjà vu in the Nordic countries and why the sociological perspective is crucial to understand COVID-19. *Acta Sociologica* 63(4): 439-442.
- World Health Organization Regional Office for South-East Asia. 2009. Pandemic H1N1 2009 Report of Regional Consultation on Pandemic H1N1 2009 and Strengthening Country Capacity for Pandemic Preparedness. <https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/205605/B4399.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> [1 December 2022].
- Yashiro, K., Miyagawa, S., & Sawa, Y. 2018. A lesson from the thalidomide tragedy - The past is never dead. It's not even past. William Faulkner, from "Requiem for a Nun" *Circulation Journal* 82(9): 2250-2252.
- Zabeen, I. A., & Zubaida Khatun, M. M. H. 2020. Comparative study on strategies for the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of birth defects. *The Pharma Innovation Journal* 9(2):72-80.

Azlinda Abdul Samad\* (corresponding author)  
 Postgraduate student  
 Faculty of Law University of Malaya  
 Email: 75linda75@gmail.com

Abdul Samad Abdul Ghani Senior Lecturer  
 Faculty of Law University of Malaya  
 Email: abdulsg@um.edu.my