
Polemik LGBT di Indonesia dari Perspektif Majlis Ulama Indonesia (MUI) dan Jaringan Islam Liberal (JIL)

Munadi Usman

ABSTRACT

The LGBT issue re-emerged in Indonesia and has become a warm polemic in society, this issue has split the community into two groups, the supportive and the rejecting groups. Each side expressed their views on this issue with different reasons and approaches. The two most distinct groups of differing views on this issue are the Indonesian Ulama Council and the Liberal Islam Network. This study examines the evolutionary thinking dynamics among LGBT Indonesian Muslim scholars, with the aim of understanding the basis, approach and reasons used by each in determining opinions about LGBT behavior. The approach used in this study is descriptive comparative, namely the type of research used to compare between two groups or more than a certain variable. As for the conclusion of this study that MUI strongly opposes LGBT behavior under the pretext of contradicting the Qoran-Hadis and human nature created in pairs. While JIL groups support LGBT under the pretext of sexual preference and human rights.

Keywords: LGBT, Polemic, Indonesia, Indonesian Ulama Council, Liberal Islam Network

INTRODUCTION

In the globalization era human is faced with a variety of actual issues that are interesting to be discussed, both in informal speech frames and in official contexts using scientific rules. One of them is the issue of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) behavior that is rife in society, some refuse this behavior because it is considered threatening human existence, but some others accept and defend this behavior as a form of individual rights that need to be respected and protected.

The LGBT issue has actually been a topic of considerable debate within the civilization of mankind. Community norms that condemn various kinds of sexual deviations get challenges from groups who feel disadvantaged over these norms. This kind of debate is becoming increasingly visible after the campaign launched by the LGBT movement that began in Western society. The forerunner of this movement was the formation of Gay Liberation Front (GLF) in London in 1970, inspired by the previous liberation movement at Stonewall, USA at 1969 (Myers 2003: 1).

The presence of LGBT in Indonesia has led to widespread polemics, the majority of communities rejecting such behavior as perceived to be contrary to moral and theological values. So that many LGBT individuals get scolding and rejection everywhere, especially religious organizations and educational institutions. The Indonesian Ulama Council firmly rejects the existence of LGBT groups in Indonesia...
that are considered to be contrary to the religion, morals and culture of the nation. Religious assemblies consisting of Islam, Catholicism, Buddhism and Confucianism also express their rejection of LGBT on the grounds that such behavior is a disorder and sexual aberration. The religious assembly views LGBT activities as opposed to Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution article 29 paragraph 1 and Law No. 1 of 1974 on Marriage. LGBT activity is also judged to be contrary to the doctrinal principles of any religion.

Although there are many who reject LGBT, there are also those who support such behavior. The most vocal party voicing support for this community is the Liberal Islam Network (JIL) that faithfully provides support and advocacy for the LGBT movement in Indonesia. JIL leaders provided a plea for LGBT people through writing, social media and also the discussions that were attended by them. They always oppose any opinions and policies that discredit LGBT groups.

LGBT polemics are still going on warmly up to now between those who refused and who accepted this behavior. Each has its own point of view and reason for viewing LGBT behavior. The study of LGBT polemic in Indonesia is an interesting matter, in order to know the dynamics and treasures of thought of Muslim scholars on this issue. The approach used in this study is descriptive comparative, namely the type of research used to compare between two groups or more than a certain variable.

**LGBT IN VIEW OF INDONESIAN COUNCIL OF ULAMA (MUI)**

Related to LGBT which recently became a polemic in Indonesian society, MUI has established law for this matter through Fatwa Number 57, Year 2014 about Lesbian, Gay, Sodomy and Obscenity. This fatwa is based on the people’s desire to have a clear legal stipulation about LGBT that is happening in society. As an institution authorized to establish Islamic law, the MUI has reviewed and formulated a fatwa on LGBT law according to Islam. In the fatwa, the MUI established eleven points of law related to LGBT, that is (MUI 2014):

1. Sexual intercourse is only allowed for couples who have a husband and wife relationship, the couple men and women based on legitimate marriage in syar’i.
2. Sexual orientation to the same sex is a disorder that must be cured and irregularities that must be straightened out.
3. Homosexual, both lesbian and gay are banned (haram), and is a form of crime (jarimah).
4. Homosexual perpetrators, both lesbian and gay, including bisexual are subject to hudud and/or ta’zir punishment by the authorities.
5. Sodomy of the law is prohibited and is a vile act that brings great sin (faahishah).
6. Sodomy perpetrators are subject to punishment of ta’zir whose maximum sentence is death penalty.
7. Homosexual activity other than by sodomy (liwath) law is prohibited and the perpetrator is subject to ta’zir punishment.
8. Sexual assault activities such as groping, squeezing, and other activities without legitimate marriage bonds, performed by a person, whether committed to other types or same-sex, to adults and children of the law are prohibited.
9. The perpetrator of obscenity as referred to in number 8 shall be subjected to ta’zir punishment.
10. In the case of the victim of homosexual crime (finger), sodomy, and immorality are children, the perpetrator is subjected to a penalty of punishment to the death penalty.
11. Legalize same-sex sexual activity and other deviant sexual orientations is prohibited.

Based on the fatwa, it can be understood that the MUI views LGBT behavior as a form of sexual deviation that is unlawful and should be shunned by Muslims. Individual LGBT has the right to be punished in the form of had or ta’zir, punishable even by death penalty if the victims are children. MUI establishes LGBT behavior as a crime (jarimah), both lesbian, gay, bisexual and others. Then they can be punished for such behavior.

In determining the fatwa, the MUI has several reasons and arguments that become the backdrop. Among others that LGBT behavior has deviated from the human nature created in pairs (male and female). The nature of human sexual desire to their different types of partners, not the same sex. Among the propositions that explain about human nature is surah Al-Nisa (4) verse 1:

All men, fear your Lord, who created you from one soul, and from him God created his wife; and of them God has multiplied many men and women, and fear Allah who by His name you ask one another, and (nurture) the relationship of silaturrahim. Allah always guards and keeps watch over you.

The above verse contains the command that humans fear Allah SWT who has created man from the one body of Prophet Adam. Then from the left rib of
Prophet Adam also created his wife Siti Hawa (of the other sex) as a spouse or wife. From these two came men’s and women’s descendants in large numbers to live on earth and prosper. So man is created in pairs, and is commanded to marry his different kind of mates, such as the marriage of Prophet Adam and Siti Hawa. Marriage with the opposite sex is a human nature to be able to reproduce offspring. While same-sex marriage is a vain case (does not produce offspring) and also violate the human nature that has been predestined God in pairs (Az-Zuhailly 2003, 2:555).

About the prohibition of same-sex sexual intercourse, MUI understand it from the content of QS. Al-Shu’ara (26) verses 165-166, that is:

Why do you have sex with men among men? and ye leave the wives of thy Lord made unto thee, ye are indeed transgressors.

This verse tells the story of the Prophet Luths people as the same-sex, when there are women who they can marry, but they do not marry and prefer the same sex. Allah called them as the rebels, has stopped over the nature that has been established by God to channeling his passion to the opposite sex. In another verse, ie QS. Al-‘Araf (7) verses 80-81 are also told the same thing, that is:

…and (we have also sent) Luth (to his people), (remember) when He said to them: “Why do you work the deeds of vile, which no one has ever done (in this world) before you?” Surely you go to men to release your lusts (to them), not to women, instead you are transgressing people.

When Prophet Luth asked them to abandon the act they challenged him to bring a punishment if their deeds were wrong. Then Allah sends down the punishment by overturning the land and bringing down the hot sulfur from the fire of hell on them. This event is narrated in the Qur’an surah Hud (11) verse 82;

And when Our Lord comes We will make the land of the Luthhites up and down (We reverse), and We bail them with stones from the burning ground with insistence.

While the hadith used among other Bukhari hadith history of Abdullah ibn Mas’ud ra. The Prophet Muhammad said: “No woman touching skin (in one dress) with a woman, then she would imagine it was her husband who seemed to be seeing it.” Then the hadith of Watsilah ibn al-Asqa’ narrated by Al-Bayhaqi, the Prophet said: “the sexual relations of women with fellow women is adultery” (Kanz al-Umal. Vol. 5. Number of Hadis 13103).

Gay and lesbian law is similar to adultery, based on the content of the hadith Abu Musa’s narration that the Prophet said:

When a man has sexual intercourse with a man, they commit adultery, and if a woman intercedes with a woman, they commit adultery (Kanz al-Umal, Vol. 5. Number of Hadis 13103).

In another hadith the Prophet also explained about lesbian law which is narrated by Bayhaqi from Watsilah ibn al-Asqa’; “that the sexual relationship of women with fellow women is adultery.” (Kanz al-Umal. Vol. 5. Number of Hadis 13010)

The Prophet is cursed the perpetrators of homosexuality, in his hadith he repeatedly cursed those who worked on the deed. From Ibn ‘Abbas, narrated by An-Nasai and Ahmad the Prophet Muhammad said:

Allah cursed the people who do the actions of the people of the Prophet Luth, Allah cursed people who do the actions of the people of Prophet Luth, Allah cursed people who do the actions of the people of the Prophet Luth.

The opinion of the ulama referred to MUI in determining LGBT law among others is Al-Syairazy, he stated that “ilwhath” (copulation into the anus) law is banned based on QS. Al-A’raf verse 80 and QS. Al-An’am verse 151. As a fact forbidding such acts, Allah SWT has tortured the people of Luths with tortures that have never been inflicted upon anyone before due to their vile. This is a proposition also forbidden “sodomy.” As a matter of prohibition, God has tortured the Luthians with tortures that had never been inflicted upon the people before in the aftermath of such abominable acts. This is a proposition also forbidden “sodomy.” Whoever does it, while he is among those who can be subjected to adultery, then it is obligatory for him to adultery (Al-Syairazy 2015: 339).

Al-Nawawi argued that the hadith of the Prophet which prohibits men wrestling with fellow men in one dress, and likewise for women with fellow women, is a strict prohibition, if in direct contact without coating between aurat both. This is a proposition also forbidden to touch the same sex in any part of any kind. This law is the agreement among scholars (Al-Nawawi 2014: 31).

Zakaria Al-Ansari suggests that it is forbidden to lie down for two men or two women in one dress naked even though each of them is just adjacent to the bed. He holds to the Muslim hadith narrated about the prohibition of a man wrestling with fellow men in a single dress, as well as fellow women. (Anshari 2016: 113). Abdur Rauf Al-Munawi explains the content of hadith, “The sexual intercourse of the fellow woman is adultery,” that her intention is like adultery in the same sinfulness, although it is different in weight. In this matter is not subject to had (a predetermined
punishment), but *ta’zir* (a tentative punishment) because it is done without intercourse. The word adultery in general which includes adultery of the eyes, feet, hands and mouth is figurative or similar (Al-Munawi 2016: 137).

In reference to the Qur’an and Hadith as well as the opinions of the above scholars, the MUI imposes a law prohibited on LGBT behavior. The institution of legal consideration considers LGBT’s behavior to have deviated from the human nature that God predestined in pairs and sexual intercourse with the opposite sex, not same sex, so that human existence is maintained. Through relationships with the opposite sex, humans can multiply and carry on their offspring. Therefore, the MUI prohibits LGBT as a preventive measure of the development of this behavior in a wider society. Previously in 1997 MUI has also made a fatwa on the position of transvestites. In the consideration of the fatwa MUI states that transgender are male and can not be viewed as a group (sex) of its own, and all behavior of transvestites who are deviant is forbidden and should be attempted to be returned to the original nature.

**LGBT IN THE VIEW OF LIBERAL ISLAMIC NETWORK (JIL)**

Liberal Islam Network Leaders (JIL) have defended and justified LGBT behavior. They consider the behavior to be innate to someone who is not to be questioned, nor is it a disease to be cured. To get the views of JIL leaders on LGBT, the authors quote from their official website, namely: islamlib.com/, as well as other sites that contain their posts and comments. JIL leaders who cited his opinion on this issue include Ulil Absar Abdalla, M. Royyan Firdaus, Khairul Anwar and others. Following their views:

1. Ulil Absar Abdalla

According him, LGBT does not conflict with human nature. In addressing this issue, he holds to two principles, namely the principle of science and the principle of generosity (tolerance). Both principles are believed to be very compatible with the value of Islam. Islam teaches its people to appreciate science and knowledge. In the Qur’an the word science and its derivation are called many times in various places, this shows how important the science of Islam is.

Meanwhile, generosity is also commanded by Islam. The generous attitudes that mean here are tolerant, generous to others, respect them, even though they are different from us, as implied in surah Al-Hujarat (49) verse 13, that is;

O mankind, We created you from a man and a woman and made you nation and tribe so that you may know one another. Verily the most honorable among you by Allah is the most pious among you. Allah is the Knower.

Based on the principle of science should be a Muslim to be against everything based on data and scientific evidence, if the problem encountered involves the facts of science, then ignore science is clearly not in accordance with the teachings of the Koran. There are two branches of science involved in research on LGBT, namely psychology/psychiatry and biology, especially the branch of biology that deals with genetics. For a long time, psychiatry in the Western world assumed that homosexuality was a disease. Who once watched the “Game Theory” movie about British scientists who laid the foundations for modern computers, Alan Turing, must have known how the authority in England at that time (in the 1950s) still regarded LGBT as a disease, even a crime. Therefore Turing was forced to perform a therapy that in the psychiatric world is called “reparative therapy,” Turing eventually committed suicide, because he was not strong enough to face the therapy (Ulil Absar Abdalla 2016).

The science and political authority in Britain up to the decade of the 1950s when Turing lived thought that homosexuality was a “mental disorder,” even a crime, to be treated. But research on homosexuality never stops. In the 70s, the opinions of psychiatrists in the world began to change. Based on their research, it was concluded that homosexuality is not a disease or “mental disorder,” but a reasonable variation of sexual preferences.

In 1973, the American Psychiatric Association lifted homosexuality and lesbians from a list of mental illnesses. And in 1975, the American Psychological Association also took similar steps. Psychiatric and psychological experts around the world follow this step, not least in Indonesia. The Mental Disorder Diagnostic Guidelines (PPDGJ) guidelines for psychiatric experts in Indonesia have released homosexuality and lesbianism from a list of mental disorder. In the 2nd edition of PPDGK 1983 and 1993 issue III, homosexuality has also been excluded from the list of mental disorder.

Until now, scientist consensus in the world is almost final that homosexuality is not a disease, and therefore reparative therapy for sexual preference is not recommended at all, even rejected. The WHO in 1990 followed this consensus, that homosexuality is not a disease, but a ordinary preference. This preference exists in the animal world, even in a lot, as well as in the human world. From that he concluded
that LGBT is not a disease according to scientists, because the teachings of the Qur’an require respect for science, it is fitting that the views of Muslims on this issue also change, and not merely follow the views inherited by the ancestral tradition (Ulil Absar Abdalla 2016).

Meanwhile, the principle of generosity, which is an Islamic principle, requires a Muslim to avoid homophobic attitudes, namely to hate individuals who have homosexual preferences. We may disagree with them, even hate or disgust at their sexual behavior. But dislike to them should not prevent us from being fair to them. While the Qur’an teach people to be fair, even to those we do not like though. Allah says in surah Al-Maidah verse 8:

O ye who believe! You shall be those who always establish (righteousness) for Allah, being a fair witness, and let not your hatred of any people, encourage you to be unfair. Be fair, because fair is closer to piety, and fear Allah, Verily Allah is well acquainted with what you do.

According to Ulil, the verse is often quoted by Nurcholish Madjid (Cak Nur) first in describing the principle of justice, because the justness is closer to piety. The manifestation of fairness to LGBT groups is to give them equal rights to life, not to discriminate. One fair attitude also is not to force LGBT to do healing therapy. The only therapy that is allowed in one case is when there are LGBT individuals who feel disturbed by their sexual tendencies; for example, he is disturbed by homosexuality and ask for treatment, then against him may be done reparative therapy action. But this therapy should not be imposed on any LGBT individual simply because they consider them to be irregular (Ulil Absar Abdalla 2016).

2. Muhammad Royyan Firdaus

He is reviews the LGBT in an article titled “HAM for LGBT” released by the Liberal Islam website. He explained that LGBT in Indonesia are often discriminated against. These communities are placed in peripheral positions within public contexts that view normal sexual relationships as opposed to the opposite sex. According to him, the existing public constitution has always been legitimized by religious misunderstandings that regard LGBT as immoral, less-religious, social sickness, outlaw and even accused of being an ally of demons.

Religious interpretation hegemony of heteronatvivitas also legalize acts of discrimination against LGBT actors, ranging from associating the LGBT with HIV/AIDS, the broadcasting of soap operas on TV that smells discrediting LGBT like soap opera “Azab bagi Homoseksual” (a Doom for Homosexuals), raids Satuan Pamong Praja Police Unit, to the people’s negative mindset to them. Theologically, the rejection of homosexuals is based on Qur’anic verses that tell of the Prophet Luth as QS. Al-Naml (27): 54-58, Al-’Araf (7): 80-81, Al-Shu’ara (26): 160-175. In addition, also based on some traditions of the Prophet such as the hadith narrated Al-Thabrani and Al-Baihaqi, Ibn Abbas, Ahmad, Abu Daud, Muslim and Turmuzi. The scholars use the arguments to judge the LGBT and see them as animals (M. Royyan Firdaus 2011).

According to him, it is naive to associate the punishment that happened to the prophets of Luth as a result of their homosexual behavior. But it is more appropriate if the doom is caused by denial, scorn and threat they will expel Prophet Luthh and his guest of honor. The punishment is also due more to the pride of those who challenge God to bring punishment and torment to them. As proof of God does not hate the LGBT, that in countries that legalize such behavior as the Dutch, British, Canadian and others they are safe and well.

In principle, LGBT includes socio-cultural sexual variants such as Warok Reog in Ponorogo, Wandhu in Ludrak tradition and Bugis Cirebon dance. and LGBT are given (giving) from God. According to the Human Genome Project report, homosexuality is an inherent potential in everyone. The structure of the human gene is initially female, and then the Y chromosome that makes a person a man, is actually an aberration to the human chromosomal arrangement. Only, in human beings every human level deviation is different. If the deviation is total, then a person becomes a man, and if the deviation is not total, then there is another human kind, including homosexual. Paying attention to cases of discrimination against LGBT people, such as state demands that they do therapy to restore homosexuality, clearly indicate a violation of a person’s private rights, for forcing them to abandon their perceived self-identity for the sake of a public morale majority to minorities (M. Royyan Firdaus 2011).

3. Khoirul Anwar

On the article entitled “The LGBT Theory in the Qur’an” published on liberal Islamic site. He states that there is not a single verse in the Qur’an explicitly banning LGBT. Nor does any single verse expressly accept such behavior. For that reason everyone has the right to interpret the relevant intentions in relation to this matter.

He specifically criticize the Qur’anic verses that are often understood to prohibit LGBT behavior, then
offer some verses that allow such behavior. According to the opinion which prohibits LGBTI refers to the verses that tell about the people of the Prophet Luth, among others, QS. Al-'Araf verses 80-81, but in fact these verses are an entertainment for the Prophet Muhammad to be mentally strong in the face of the Quraysh who much opposed his da'wah. It can be understood if the verse is read in its entirety with due regard to the cause of the verse and the relationship of the verse before and after (Khairul Anwar 2016).

The verse on the story of the sodom is revealed in Mecca, in the event of a rejection of Prophet Mohammad’s propagation by the Quraisy authorities. Then Allah sent down the verse to convey about the previous apostles who also faced the same thing when doing da’wah, so that he was comforted and motivated to continue his da’wah. This can be understood from the purpose of QS. Al-'Araf (7): 34-186, Hud (11): 70, 74, 77, 81, 89, Al-Hajj (22): 43, Al-Hijr (15): 59, 61, Al-Syu’ara (26): 160, 161, 167, Al-Naml (27) 56, and QS. Al-Ankabut (29): 26. From these verses, it can not be understood about the prohibition of LGBTI, but merely entertainment for the Prophet to remain steadfast in preaching.

On the contrary, according to another verse LGBTI has a place, if aware that the diversity of sexual orientation is something that is innate (nature/nature) as understood from the QS. Al-Isra’ (17): 84: “Everyone does according to his own circumstances. So your Lord knows better who is more righteous his way.”

In the Lisan Al-Arab dictionary, the word “syakilah” means creation (khaliqah), form (al-Syakl), bow (tariqah) and orientation (be). In the Qur’an there is also the promise of God that someday the inhabitants of heaven will be accompanied by handsome young men who will never turn old, they called “wildamun mukhalladun” (children who remain young). It can be found in QS. Al-Waqi’ah (56): 17, QS. Al-Insan (76): 19 and Al-Thur (52): 24. The promise of the Qur’an is closely related to the condition of the people who are invited to speak, or in accordance with the imagination of the society in which the Koran is revealed. In this context many of the men are fond of or have a sexual passion for handsome youngsters, therefore the Quran promises so (Khoirul Anwar 2016).

Furthermore, in QS. Al-Nur verse 31 which speaks of the command of covering body, that the woman of faith may show her nakedness to “ghairi uli al-irbah min al-rijal” (man who has no passion for women). The commentators disagreed about the intentions of the verse, some of them interpreting an old man who no longer craved women. Meanwhile, according to Mujahid is a fool or moron (al-ablah). Meanwhile, according to Ikrimah, the term is shown to men who like the same sex (gay) or transgender (mukhannats). There it appears that the response of the Quran to gay men is a fairness, or in terms of QS. Al-Isra verse 84 above as “syakilah,” which is a form of diversity of sexual orientation that need not be denied. The difference in this matter is not to be disputed, for only God knows the truth or the reality.

This diversity of sexual orientation is reinforced by several narrations which inform that in the history of Islam many people channel sexual passions to same-sex. Muhammad Jalal Kisyk quotes Ibn Hazmin as narrating that Muhammad son of Abdurrahman bin Hakam, a warlord, in power to succeed his father, he has two young and handsome ministers, every night one of them both to sleep with him.

It was once known by Ibn Abbas when staying at his palace, that night Ibn Abbas saw two handsome young boys called by Muhammad bin Abdurrahman bin Hakam. One of them was brought into the room, Muhammad when it was open chest and closed the door while both were in one room. Such romance stories in Arabic literature are quite easy to find, including same-sex love, homosexuality or in more complex terms now called LGBT (Khoirul Anwar 2016).

From the above description of the views of JIL figures related to LGBT, it can be concluded that they do not view LGBT as a crime or sexual perversion that must be destroyed. They propose various reasons in the form of scientific findings (science) as well as the results of reinterpretation of scriptural texts on LGBT. In science, LGBT is considered normal as a human sexual preference since birth, world health agencies such as WHO have also removed LGBT from the list of mental illness (mental disorder) that must be cured.

CONCLUSION

Indonesian Ulama Council (MUI) views LGBT as a form of sexual deviation that is forbidden and must be shunned by Muslims. LGBT contradicts the human nature created in pairs (male and female), then marries one another to gain happiness and bear children. LGBT attitudes can threaten human and humanities existence, because this behavior can sever human offspring and undermine the order of human life that has been destined to live in pairs in legitimate marriage bonds.
In the view of the Liberal Islam Network (JIL), LGBT is not a crime or a deviation that must be eradicated according to science and also the result of reinterpretation of scriptural texts about LGBT. Scienceally, LGBT is considered normal as a diverse human sexual preference, and it is by no means a mental disorder. The World Health Organization (WHO) has excluded LGBT from mental illness, so it does not need to be rehabilitated to be cured. The reinterpretation of JIL figures against verses that prohibit LGBT also shows that chronologically the verse is not entirely relevant to the present LGBT phenomenon, so it can not be used as a proposition to prohibit LGBT emerging today.

There is a fundamental difference between the opinions of MUI and JIL on LGBT. Although both refer to the value of humanity and scriptural proposition, the conclusions of the two groups are different. MUI adheres to the traditional commentary which prohibits LGBT contained in verses of the Qur’an and hadith that denounce and prohibit the behavior of the people of Prophet Luth. while the JIL interprets LGBT verses from different perspectives. They are irrelevant in relation to current LGBT behavior, because there are scientific findings that LGBT is a natural human innate form of sexual preference, such behavior can not be considered as infringing, since countries that legalize LGBT are now seen to be safe not to be imposed the punishment of the Luth.

REFERENCES


Dr. Munadi Usman
Lecturer in Islamic Law
State Islamic Institute Lhokseumawe, Indonesia
Emel: munadiusman83@gmail.com