Volume 21, Issue 4, DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.17576/ebangi.2024.2104.29</u>

Bibliometric Analysis

Bibliometric Analysis of Global Media Representations of Marginalized Groups

Caiwei Li, Mohd. Nor Shahizan Ali*, Ammar Redza Ahmad Rizal & Jingwen Xu

Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM), 43600 Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia

*Corresponding Author: shahizan@ukm.edu.my

Received: 20 September 2024 Accepted: 20 November 2024

Abstract: Over the years, the media have consistently influenced society and culture through the process of mediatization. Therefore, many public stereotypes regarding marginalized or vulnerable groups often originate from media discourse strategies. This study investigates the terms "marginalized groups," "media," and "representation" to perform a bibliometric analysis of 660 published articles from 2014 to 2023, concentrating on how the media portrays marginalized communities. The analysis covers essential metrics, including yearly publication rates, source journals, authorship, countries involved, and citation counts. Techniques such as keyword co-occurrence analysis, clustering analysis, and temporal evolution analysis are applied to summarize and assess the current landscape and future directions of this domain. The research utilizes the software tools POP (Publish or Perish) and VOSviewer to evaluate the present situation, identify research hotspots, and track the development within the field. In the past decade, research in this field has generally grown, with Western countries making significant contributions. The frequent occurrence of keywords highlights a strong focus on the media's role in shaping public opinion and fostering inclusivity, using content analysis and adapting to current crises, such as COVID-19. The study identifies five main clusters: mass media, anthropology, public health, gender studies, and sexual minority health, showing the evolving diversity in media research on marginalized groups. Research progression spans three stages: the Preparatory Development Period (2014-2016), Growth Challenge Period (2017-2019), and Hotspot Research Period (2020 - 2023).

Keywords: Bibliometric analysis; marginalized groups; media; representation; communication

Introduction

As purveyors of information and creators of cultural significance, the media hold a vital position in educating the public, functioning as a communicative link between political and social entities, shaping perceptions of important matters, and portraying themes and people in particular contexts. This impact can affect individuals' political opinions and their level of engagement (Bleich et al., 2015). Media exert a powerful impact on society and culture through a process of mediatization, whereby media evolve into an independent institution with their own logic (Hjarvard, 2008). Research, both theoretical and empirical, suggests that the information disseminated by mass media gives rise to stereotypes, which are then reinforced through interactions with that information (Mastro & Tukachinsky, 2012). Concurrently, the media hold the potential for empowerment and advocacy. In many parts of the world, media personnel often perpetuate everyday prejudices against marginalized community members, whether through derogatory, offensive, and abusive language or through other strategies that serve to marginalize and silence discourse. News media frequently portray minority group members through a negative lens and typically represent them as a homogeneous group rather than as

individuals (Jamil & Retis, 2023). When Robert. E. Park (Park, 1928) first introduced the concept of the marginal man; he believed that a marginal man is one fated to live in two societies and two cultures, which are not only different but also contradictory. However, throughout history, understanding "marginality" has been a dynamic, dialectical process evolving with the times. Over the past century, numerous studies have addressed the definition of marginalized groups (Barron, 1999; Carilli, 2021).

This paper aims to encompass the research on marginalized groups from a literature perspective, including minority groups, vulnerable people, underrepresented groups, and disadvantaged groups within the scope of marginalized groups. In conclusion, these groups are defined by their marginalized status across various social, economic, political, and cultural contexts. Discrimination is encountered, which leads to restricted opportunities and challenges in accessing resources stemming from various elements, including race, gender, sexual orientation, socioeconomic status, and health issues.

In recent years, extensive literature has explored marginalized groups from anthropological and sociological dimensions, focusing on cultural practices, identity formation, and social interactions. These studies reveal the unique positions of marginalized groups within social structures and the multiple challenges they encounter (Marino & Faas, 2020; Asif et al., 2021; Zhang et al., 2023). Despite a growing awareness of issues faced by minorities, individuals from immigrant backgrounds, ethnocultural communities, diverse racial identities, or those who identify as lesbian, bisexual, gay, or transgender, as well as those from low-income households, continue to experience unequal access to media compared to the majority within society (Jamil & Retis, 2023).

In the past decade, with the further proliferation of digitalization and the internet, the speed and scope of media dissemination have reached unprecedented levels. Consequently, academic papers on media representations of marginalized groups across various fields have significantly increased. However, existing research often has a limited scope, focusing on specific countries, types of media, or groups, and lacks a comprehensive view of the issue. There is a pressing need for systematic analysis of the trends, patterns, and impacts of these representations. Bibliometric analysis can uncover overarching trends and shifts in research focus over time. This approach not only highlights influential studies, journals, and authors within the field but also identifies research gaps and underexplored areas that warrant further investigation. Such a comprehensive analysis is essential for understanding how academic discourse on this topic has evolved, guiding future studies, and informing evidence-based policies that address the needs and representations of marginalized communities.

A bibliometric analysis involves the examination and categorization of bibliographic sources by creating concise representations of existing literature (Donthu et al., 2020). This approach serves as a valuable technique for assessing the development of research subjects, encompassing themes and published works within diverse areas of social, cognitive, and theoretical perspectives (Filho et al., 2022). This paper aims to perform a bibliometric analysis of the literature concerning the media portrayals of marginalized groups globally, intending to serve as a reference for future research and development in this area. In light of this, the subsequent research questions have been formulated:

RQ1: What is the existing state of publications regarding media portrayals of marginalized groups? RQ2: What citation trends can be identified in the publications focusing on media representations of marginalized groups?

RQ3: Which themes related to media representations of marginalized groups are favored by researchers?

RQ4: What are the evolutionary trends of research on media representations of marginalized groups?

Methodology

This research initially defined the topic of investigation and subsequently performed data collection via the Scopus database platform on July 26, 2024. To minimize possible bias due to daily updates in the database, a reproducibility test was conducted on the same day. Scopus, recognized as one of the most extensive abstract and citation databases worldwide, encompasses nearly 36,377 books from around 11,678 publishers and 34,346 peer-reviewed journals. The selection of Scopus was due to its reputation as "the largest single abstract and indexing database ever created" and its status as the most extensive searchable citation and abstract database (Ahmi et al., 2019). However, the Scopus database has certain limitations, with one notable issue

being its bias toward publications from Europe and North America, leading to limited coverage of academic research from non-Western countries and regions. This uneven geographical distribution may introduce bias in global research analyses, making it difficult for studies conducted from non-Western perspectives to be adequately represented.

According to the research protocol illustrated in Figure 1, the authors collected documents for this study from the Scopus database as of July 26, 2024. Given the specific focus of this research on the themes of "marginalized groups," "media," and "representation," synonyms for each term were included in the search. Subsequently, a set of processes was performed to cleanse the data and remove any duplicate documents. Afterward, data analysis and visualization took place using tools such as Microsoft Excel, Harzing's Publish or Perish, and VOSviewer software. This analytical process covered essential elements of how marginalized groups are represented in media from diverse viewpoints, such as yearly publication counts, journal sources, contributing authors, countries of origin, and citation metrics, aiming to enhance understanding. Utilizing methods like keyword co-occurrence analysis, clustering analysis, and temporal evolution analysis, the research investigated the present landscape, thematic research areas, and developmental trends concerning media portrayals of marginalized groups across various dimensions.



Figure 1. Flowchart for study selectioni

The specific procedures for this study are as follows: First, VOSviewer software is used to conduct basic statistical analysis, generating descriptive statistics to explore the research status of media representations of marginalized groups and address RQ1. Second, citation metrics are summarized to identify highly cited articles and analyze citation networks, including countries and sources, to answer RQ2. Next, co-occurrence and cluster analyses are conducted using VOSviewer software to reveal the most popular themes within this topic, addressing RQ3. Finally, a keyword analysis of each significant developmental stage over the past two decades is performed to summarize the research history and evolutionary trends of media representations of marginalized groups, answering RQ4.

Findings

1. Annual Publication Volume Analysis

The yearly count of publications within a specific knowledge area serves as a crucial measure of scientific research advancement. It somewhat demonstrates the growth of knowledge within that domain and the

progress made by scholars in their studies (Wang et al., 2023). Figure 2 illustrates the data on publications related to media portrayals of marginalized communities since 2014. Starting with 34 articles in 2014, the number surged to 117 by 2023, pointing to a clear upward trajectory. This trend indicates an escalation in scholarly outputs related to the representation of marginalized groups in media, drawing increased interest from researchers and emphasizing the rising significance of this subject.



Figure 2. Bar graph illustrating yearly publication volume

2. Analysis of Source Journals

Table 1 displays the ten journals that have published the most articles. Leading the list is Journalism Practice. which published 14 articles related to media representations of marginalized groups. The Journal of Homosexuality published 12 articles, while Journalism, Media Culture & Society, and PLoS One each published nine articles. These journals cover various disciplines, including journalism, communication studies, sociology, and psychology, and span research areas such as media culture, communication theory, gender studies, and journalism production. This indicates that the research topic of media representations of marginalized groups has successfully garnered attention from multiple disciplines. Such academic research is increasingly breaking disciplinary boundaries, employing multi-faceted and multi-layered analyses to explore the complex issues faced by marginalized groups.

No	Source Title	Frequency
1	Journalism Practice	14
2	Journal Of Homosexuality	12
3	Journalism	9
3	Media Culture and Society	9
3	Plos One	9
6	Howard Journal of Communications	8
6	Journal Of Lesbian Studies	8
8	Feminist Media Studies	7
8	Journalism Studies	7
9	BMC Public Health	6
9	Newspaper Research Journal	

3. Author Analysis

Analyzing the statistics of literature authors can reveal the level of focus that various scholars place on related research subjects and assist in pinpointing the prominent core research teams currently engaged in the field.

The 660 papers in this study were authored by 1,892 individuals. Moreover, Table 2 presents the leading 10 authors ranked by the number of publications. The analysis reveals that Jacob L. is the most prolific author in this research area, having authored a total of 5 papers.

Authors	Articles	Percentage (%)
Jacobs, L.	5	0.76
Cover, R.	4	0.61
Dhaenens, F.	4	0.61
Katz, N.	4	0.61
Li, J.	4	0.61
Park, S.Y.	4	0.61
Xu, Q.	4	0.61
Breazu, P.	3	0.45
Dhoest, A.	3	0.45
Godinez, H.	3	0.45

Table 2. Most relevant authors

4. Country Scientific Production

This analysis highlights the leading 10 countries regarding their scientific productivity related to the subject of media portrayals of marginalized populations (see Table 3). The study found that 66 countries contributed to the Scopus database on this topic, with the United States (USA) publishing approximately 255 articles, making it the leading country in terms of publication volume. In addition, the research contributions primarily come from Western countries, while research from Africa, South America, and some Central Asian countries remains sparse.

No	Country	Frequency
1	United States	255
2	United Kingdom	84
3	Australia	42
4	Canada	35
5	China	24
6	Netherlands	21
7	Spain	19
8	Belgium	18
8	Germany	18
8	India	18

Table 3. Leading 10 nations ranked by article publication count

5. Citations Patter on Media Representation of Marginalized Communities

The purpose of this section is to pinpoint the key articles that significantly impact the understanding of media portrayals of marginalized populations, as well as to depict the citation trends of these works through data obtained from the Scopus database. In addressing RQ2, we provided an overview of citation metrics, examined the citation network associated with the articles, and utilized Publish or Perish alongside VOSviewer software for our data analysis.Citations are formal references to any sources used when writing an article. This information is crucial for bibliometric research as it helps calculate the number of citations for specific documents. The citation statistics for the literature gathered up to July 26, 2024, can be found in Table 4. Out of the 660 articles collected, there were 6,387 citations in total, resulting in an average of 638.7 citations per year and 9.68 citations for each paper. Table 5 presents the five articles with the highest citation counts in the area of media representations of marginalized groups. It is evident that these articles have high citation rates, with all exceeding 100 citations. The topics covered include public health and crises, social attitudes and behaviors, and the role of media. These highly cited articles focus on the media representations of various groups, including homosexuality, students of migrants and minorities, Muslims, Latinos, Asian Americans, and Native Americans(Ayoub & Garretson, 2017; Bleich, Bloemraad, et al., 2015; Tukachinsky et al., 2015).

The most frequently cited article (Comerio & Strozzi, 2019) compared media portrayals of White nonmedical opioid users with those of Black and Brown heroin users, highlighting how differing representations lead to distinct public and policy responses. Meanwhile, Tukachinsky et al. (2015) conducted a content analysis of 345 top-rated U.S. television programs over more than 20 years, finding significant underrepresentation of Latinx, Asian American, and Native American individuals, with a tendency to portray minority groups in stereotypical ways. Bleich Bloemraad, et al. (2015) shows a diverse set of new research to illustrate the ways in which media analysis advances our knowledge about migrants and minorities in the public sphere. These highly cited articles highlight critical intersections between media portrayals, social attitudes, and systemic inequalities, raising concerns about identity, inclusivity, and justice. As media plays a vital role in reinforcing or challenging stereotypes, these studies offer valuable insights into how representation affects social outcomes, such as public health responses, social integration, and minority rights. This trend toward critically examining representations reflects an important shift in media studies: to challenge dominant narratives and recognize the role of media in shaping public understanding of marginalized communities and informing social policy.

Metrics	Data	_
Timespan	2014-2023	
Citation years	10	
Papers	660	
Citations	6387	
Cites/year	638.7	
Cites/paper	9.68	
Cites/author	3031.34	
Papers/author	387.43	
Authors/paper	2.79	
h-index	36	
g-index	53	

Table 4. Citation metrics

Rank	Article Title	Cites	Author	Source Journal	Year
1	The War on Drugs That Wasn't: Wasted Whiteness, "Dirty Doctors," and Race in Media Coverage of Prescription Opioid Misuse	261	J. Netherland, H.B. Hansen	Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry	2016
2	Documenting Portrayals of Race/Ethnicity on Primetime Television over a 20-Year Span and Their Association with National-Level Racial/Ethnic Attitudes	166	R. Tukachinsky, D. Mastro, M. Yarchi	Journal of Social Issues	2015
3	Social media as a recruitment platform for a nationwide online survey of COVID-19 knowledge, beliefs, and practices in the United States: Methodology and feasibility analysis	147	S.H. Ali, J. Foreman, A. Capasso, A.M. Jones, Y. Tozan, R.J. Diclemente	BMC Medical Research Methodology	2020
4	Migrants, Minorities and the Media: Information, Representations and Participation in the Public Sphere	118	E. Bleich, I. Bloemraad, E. de Graauw	Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies	2015
5	Crisis information distribution on Twitter: a content analysis of tweets during Hurricane Sandy	116	B. Wang, J. Zhuang	Natural Hazards	2017

Simultaneously, Table 6 presents a comprehensive summary of the yearly publication and citation statistics for articles focusing on marginalized groups during the previous ten years. It is noteworthy that the years 2020 and 2021 experienced the most citations, tallying 994 and 753 citations, respectively. In addition, the 2015 and 2016 editions had the highest average citation rate, indicating that the overall quality and impact of publications in these years were particularly significant. In addition, the H and G indices peaked in 2021 and 2015 at 17 and 29, respectively. This indicates that quite a few high-quality papers have been published

Year	Total papers	%	Number of Cited Papers	Total Citations	Citations per Paper	Citations per Cited paper	h-index	g-index
2023	117	17.73%	71	237	2.03	3.34	8	10
2022	106	16.06%	86	502	4.74	5.84	11	16
2021	91	13.79%	84	994	10.92	11.83	17	26
2020	79	11.97%	74	753	9.53	10.18	15	24
2019	53	8.03%	49	488	9.21	9.96	14	19
2018	49	7.42%	42	652	13.31	15.52	16	24
2017	57	8.64%	54	783	13.74	14.50	15	25
2016	34	5.15%	34	730	21.47	21.47	12	26
2015	40	6.06%	38	903	22.58	23.76	14	29
2014	34	5.15%	32	345	10.14	10.78	11	17

over the years, some of which have a very high number of citations

Table 6. Metrics for annu	al publication and citation
---------------------------	-----------------------------

Additionally, the Citations feature reveals either the citation count for individual documents or the aggregate citations attributed to an author, organization, source, or country (Wen & Huang, 2012). Based on the criteria of at least five documents with a minimum of five citations per author, 26 countries met these standards. Figure 3 highlights only the largest connected group of items, totaling 16, excluding any unconnected items. Notably, the United States and the United Kingdom emerged as countries with a substantial number of citations in studies focused on media portrayals of marginalized communities.



Figure 3. Citation network visualization map categorized by countries

Furthermore, it is possible to analyze the citations among the titles of the sources. Citations denote how many times source title A refers to source title B and the reverse. Based on the requirements of having at least three documents and a minimum of three citations for each source title, a total of 48 source titles satisfied these criteria. Figure 4 shows only the largest set of connected items, consisting of 26 items, with unconnected items not appearing. It can be observed that citations between source titles are not very tightly interconnected.



Figure 4. Citation network visualization map categorized by source

6. Themes in Media Representation Of Marginalized Groups

To address RO3 (Which themes related to media representations of marginalized groups are favored by researchers), we examined the simultaneous appearance of keywords and phrases found in the titles and abstracts of data retrieved from Scopus. The co-occurrence of keywords occurs when two keywords are present in the same article, highlighting a relationship between these concepts (Kent Baker et al., 2020). Keywords are essential components of literature research, providing a concise summary of the document's themes and research hotspots. Researchers aiming to identify trends in their field find them to be essential. Furthermore, assessing the keywords used by authors is vital for evaluating the evolution of research themes. By removing duplicates caused by spelling differences, the analysis (refer to Table 7) highlighted the top 10 frequently used author keywords from 2014 to 2023. The high frequency of terms such as "social media," "television," and "journalism" indicates a sustained interest in how various forms of media influence public opinion. The emergence of "diversity" reflects a broader societal push for inclusivity. Methodologically, the prominence of "content analysis" signifies that researchers rely on structured and systematic approaches to dissect media content. Additionally, the inclusion of "COVID-19" as a keyword signifies an adaptive research focus, with scholars concentrating on addressing recent real-world crises and exploring how media facilitates public understanding during periods of global turmoil. This responsiveness to social issues reinforces the view of media studies as a field dedicated to addressing current events and crises, with particular attention to the media's responsibility in public communication and crisis management.

The subsequent analysis was carried out using VOSviewer software to map all keywords provided in each document, including author keywords and indexed keywords. In this section, we considered the cooccurrence of keywords that appeared at least five times. After removing synonyms, 241 keywords were identified based on this threshold. Figure 5 illustrates the network visualization of keywords from VOSviewer, with variations in color, the size of circles, font dimensions, and the thickness of connecting lines representing the strength of the relationships among the keywords. Keywords shown in the same color are generally related and frequently listed together. This visualization map identifies five distinct clusters:

- i. Cluster 1 (Red): This cluster encompasses 67 items related to mass media research, featuring keywords such as mass media, television, gender, ethnicity, and content analysis. These terms are closely related and frequently co-occur, reflecting a sustained interest in the role of mainstream media in shaping public perceptions of marginalized groups.
- ii. Cluster 2 (Green): This cluster contains 32 elements associated with anthropological subjects, indicating a growing need to understand media portrayals of marginalized communities within the contexts of cultural and social identity. Research in this area often explores the intersection of identity, tradition, and social roles, and how these factors influence media representations of these communities.
- iii. Cluster 3 (Blue): Comprising 30 elements focused on public health and pandemics, this cluster highlights the significance of media in public health communication, particularly during crises such as COVID-19. Research in this cluster examines how media coverage of health issues impacts marginalized communities, often pointing to disparities in access to healthcare information and resources, as well as the unique effects of health crises on these groups.
- iv. Cluster 4 (Yellow): This cluster includes 29 elements concentrated on gender studies, contributing to an understanding of how media reinforces or challenges gender stereotypes and influences gender

equality initiatives.

v. Cluster 5 (Purple): This final cluster, consisting of 26 items, focuses on the health of sexual minority groups. Media portrayals significantly influence public perceptions and policies affecting these communities. Research within this cluster investigates how media can either perpetuate stigma and marginalization or promote inclusion and visibility for sexual minorities, thereby impacting public health, mental well-being, and social acceptance.

Rank	Author Keywords	Frequency	Total link strength
1	Social media	61	72
2	media	42	60
3	representation	40	66
4	gender	31	54
5	race	28	50
5	Content analysis	28	40
7	television	26	36
8	Covid-19	25	41
8	journalism	25	37
10	diversity	18	44

Table 7. Top 10 frequently used author keywords with co-occurrence metrics



Figure 5. Network visualization map of all keywords

The current study has also examined the frequency of titles found in the publications as well as the interplay between the titles and abstracts of the documents sourced from the Scopus database. In this part of the paper, we analyzed the co-occurrence of words that appeared a minimum of ten times. According to this standard, a total of 389 words were identified as meeting the criteria. A co-occurrence map of these words was created using VOSviewer, illustrated in Figure 6. In this visualization network, the nodes symbolize terms or concepts, while the gaps between them reflect the relationships among each term. In this visualization map, three clusters represent three themes. It can be broadly observed that the research on media representations of marginalized groups involves three significant media categories. The red cluster mainly focuses on social media research (99 items), the blue cluster is primarily centered on newspaper research (40 items), and the green cluster pertains to film (93 items).



Figure 6. Network visualization of terms of title and abstract

7. Time Evolution Analysis

The authors roughly divided the development process of the past decade into three stages. Figures 7-9 respectively list the high-frequency keywords for these three different periods and present the overlay visualization maps. The following text will specifically analyze the changing trends in research on media representations of marginalized groups across these three stages. These figures show the evolution of terms (or keywords over time) for the co-occurrence of keyword analysis. The most recent keywords are displayed in yellow, while older terms are marked in blue. Keywords that co-occurred more than five times are shown in the figures.

Phase 1: Preparatory Development Period (2014-2016)

Through the analysis of Scopus data, it can be seen that before 2014, the number of articles on media representations of marginalized groups was consistently below 30 per year. Starting from 2014, the number of articles has not fallen below 30 annually. Although 2014-2016 were the three years with the fewest articles within the following decade, with each year having reached 40 articles, it is noteworthy that the C/P and C/CP values for 2015 and 2016 were the highest of the decade. This indicates that these years were crucial growth periods for research on media representations of marginalized groups, during which a substantial number of highly cited papers laid a solid foundation for the field. Figure 7 shows that during this stage, the research papers covered mass media, including television and news, with a focus on minority groups, especially ethnic minorities(Hurley et al., 2015; Jacobs et al., 2015; Klocker, 2014). Additionally, some articles in this period explored the representation of women in media, including impoverished women, ethnic minority women, and women producers in the film industry who were in marginalized positions (Curato & Ong, 2015; French, 2014; Jacobs et al., 2015).



Figure 7. Overlay visualization map of all keywords from 2014-2016

Phase 2: Growth Challenge Period (2017-2019)

From 2017 to 2019, the number of publications in this phase saw a slight increase compared to the previous phase. However, it was observed that the total citations, C/P, and g-index values for these three years gradually decreased, indicating that the quality and impact of papers on this topic faced some challenges during this period. Building on the themes of the previous phase, research on mass media during this phase also focused on refugees (Coninck et al., 2018; Tusan, 2017) and vulnerable children (Bain et al., 2017). Notably, research involving sexual minority groups emerged and occupied a significant portion (Ayoub & Garretson, 2017; Baughman et al., 2017; McLaughlin & Rodriguez, 2017; Strand & Svensson, 2019) Additionally, content analysis became a crucial research method during this phase.



Figure 8. Overlay visualization map of all keywords from 2017-2019

Phase 3: Hotspot Research Period

After 2019, the period from 2020 to 2023 marks the hotspot research phase, with the number of publications steadily increasing. Notably, in 2022 and 2023, the annual total papers each exceeded 100. However, it is

worth noting that during these years, the C/P, C/CP, h-index, and g-index values were the lowest in the decade, indicating that while the number of articles grew rapidly, their quality and impact still needs further improvement. During this phase, the rapid rise of social media led to an increase in studies exploring the representation of marginalized groups on these platforms. For example, Aldamen (2023a) investigated the negative portrayal of Jordanian and Turkish Syrian refugees on social media. Lai et al. (2022) examined the incentives for minority group participation in mainstream culture via social media from another perspective. Additionally, some articles discuss the portrayal of marginalized groups in media from non-Western countries, such as the systematic underrepresentation and stereotyping of minority characters in Hindi-language cartoons in India (Laskar & Amir, 2022), and the depiction of disability in Arab films and television (O'Dell, 2023). By observing the keywords in Figure 9, it can be seen that many articles focused on COVID-19 and public health-related themes(Biswas et al., 2023; Govindarajan et al., 2023). For instance, Yücel (2021) examined how Turkish news media symbolically marginalized Syrian refugees amidst the COVID-19 pandemic.



Figure 9. Overlay visualization map of all keywords from 2020-2023

Discussion

This study provides a comprehensive overview of global research on media representations of marginalized groups. Through bibliometric analysis, it begins with a basic examination of yearly publications, source journals, authors, countries, and citation counts. Additionally, keyword co-occurrence, clustering, and temporal evolution analyses are used to summarize and assess the current state and emerging trends in the field. Focusing on literature published from 2014 to 2023, the study draws from Scopus database resources related to media portrayals of marginalized communities.

Over the past decade, there has been a general upward trend in the number of articles addressing media representations of marginalized groups. Regarding citations, the literature in this field recorded the highest total number of citations in 2021, while 2015 and 2016 exhibited the highest average number of citations per individual paper. Although the total number of papers published in 2022 and 2023 exceeds 100 each year, the number of citations has significantly declined compared to 2021. Additionally, the g-index and h-index for both years represent the lowest values observed in the past decade. This indicates that the quality of the articles requires further enhancement for the field to achieve substantial progress.

By analyzing author keywords, it was found that in addition to the explicit keywords in the topic, terms like "gender," "race," and "content analysis" are also very active author keywords. This indicates that a large number of studies address gender and race, defining marginalized or vulnerable groups from the perspectives of sexual minorities and ethnic minorities. Additionally, content analysis is an important method used in these studies. After analyzing both author keywords and index keywords, cluster analysis grouped 241 keywords into five clusters, corresponding to five significant research themes: mass media, anthropology, public health and pandemics, gender studies, and sexual minority health research. Moreover, three main research directions were summarized: 1. Exploring the representation of marginalized groups in the media. 2. Cultural diversity of minority groups and their media representation. 3. Media reporting on the health of minority groups.

Research from 2014 to 2023 can be divided into three stages: Preparatory Development Period (2014-2016): During this phase, papers primarily focused on minority groups in mass media, including television and news, with a particular emphasis on ethnic minorities. Some articles also explored the representation of women in the media, including impoverished women, minority women, and female creators in the film industry who were in marginal positions. Growth Challenge Period (2017-2019): Building on the previous phase, research during this period continued to focus on mass media but expanded to include refugees and vulnerable children. Additionally, studies on sexual minority groups emerged and gained significant traction. Hotspot Research Period (2020-2023): In this phase, the number of papers increased rapidly. There was a notable rise in articles exploring marginalized groups on social media. Furthermore, many studies addressed COVID-19 and public health-related themes.

Overall, the continuous increase in relevant publications reflects a growing academic interest in media portrayals of marginalized groups, particularly as a critical lens for interpreting socio-political changes and global events such as the COVID-19 pandemic. However, the recent decline in citation impact suggests potential gaps in research quality, highlighting the need for more rigorous studies and higher-quality publications to sustain the field's development. Notably, there exists a significant gap in studies focusing on media representations in non-Western contexts, which indicates potential biases and may lead to an incomplete understanding of how marginalized groups are portrayed globally. In the future, emphasizing non-Western perspectives can contribute to the creation of more accurate and inclusive media representation strategies, ultimately reducing stereotypes and promoting greater social equity. Simultaneously, media practitioners should adapt to evolving technologies and social changes by leveraging diverse platforms and adopting more inclusive approaches. This strategy not only empowers marginalized groups to actively participate in storytelling but also provides opportunities to advocate for their rights within the broader context of historical events and societal transformations.

Conclusion

The aim of this research is to perform a bibliometric examination of studies regarding media portrayals of marginalized communities, with the objective of assessing the current landscape of scholarship in this area, including metrics such as annual publication figures, source journals, authorship, geographical representation, and citation counts. Furthermore, it investigates key research trends and the development trajectory of publications within this sector. For this bibliometric analysis, a total of 660 articles from various journals published between 2014 and 2023 were sourced from Scopus and PubMed. This paper highlights the principal themes present in the literature over the last ten years, monitors the progression of research focuses over time, recognizes new areas of interest, and pinpoints shifts in emphasis within the discipline, laying the groundwork for future inquiries.

To conclude, through a review of studies on marginalized group media representation over the past decade, it is evident that future research could deepen content analysis methods by incorporating intersectional perspectives. Additionally, interdisciplinary collaboration with social scientists in fields such as anthropology, sociology, and public health should be promoted. Furthermore, it is crucial to establish ethical guidelines for media representation and advocate for increased diversity in media production to create a more inclusive, just, and socially responsible media environment.

Acknowledgement: I am grateful for the insightful discussions with my supervisors and colleagues, which have provided valuable inspiration for this research. Their constructive feedback and shared knowledge have significantly contributed to the development of this work.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Ahmi, A., Elbardan, H., & Raja Mohd Ali, R. H. (2019). Bibliometric Analysis of Published Literature on Industry 4.0. 2019 International Conference on Electronics, Information, and Communication (ICEIC), 1–6. https://doi.org/10.23919/ELINFOCOM.2019.8706445
- Aldamen, Y. (2023a). Can a Negative Representation of Refugees in Social Media Lead to Compassion Fatigue? An Analysis of the Perspectives of a Sample of Syrian Refugees in Jordan and Turkey. *Journalism and Media*, 4(1), 90–104. https://doi.org/10.3390/journalmedia4010007
- Aldamen, Y. (2023b). Xenophobia and Hate Speech towards Refugees on Social Media: Reinforcing Causes, Negative Effects, Defense and Response Mechanisms against That Speech. Societies, 13(4), 83. https://doi.org/10.3390/soc13040083
- Asif, M., Khoso, A. B., Tofique, S., Kiran, T., Chaudhry, N., Husain, N., & Edwards, S. J. L. (2021). Recognizing values and engaging communities across cultures: Towards developing a cultural protocol for researchers. *BMC Medical Ethics*, 22(1), 47. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12910-021-00608-4
- Ayoub, P. M., & Garretson, J. (2017). Getting the Message Out: Media Context and Global Changes in Attitudes Toward Homosexuality. *Comparative Political Studies*, 50(8), 1055–1085. https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414016666836
- Bain, J., Weishaar, H., Semple, S., Duffy, S., & Hilton, S. (2017). Vulnerable children, stigmatized smokers: The social construction of target audiences in media debates on policies regulating smoking in vehicles. *Health: An Interdisciplinary Journal for the Social Study of Health, Illness and Medicine*, 21(6), 633– 649. https://doi.org/10.1177/1363459316633279
- Barron, K. (1999). Ethics in qualitative social research on marginalized groups. *Scandinavian Journal of Disability Research*, 1(1), 38–49. https://doi.org/10.1080/15017419909510736
- Baughman, A., Clark, M., & Boehmer, U. (2017). Experiences and Concerns of Lesbian, Gay, or Bisexual Survivors of Colorectal Cancer. Oncology Nursing Forum, 44(3), 350–357. https://doi.org/10.1188/17.ONF.350-357
- Biswas, S., Hense, S., Kodali, P. B., & Thankappan, K. R. (2023). Quality of COVID-19 information, education and communication materials in India: A content analysis. *Health Education Journal*, 82(4), 390–402. Scopus. https://doi.org/10.1177/00178969231160952
- Bleich, E., Bloemraad, I., & De Graauw, E. (2015). Migrants, Minorities and the Media: Information, Representations and Participation in the Public Sphere. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 41(6), 857–873. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2014.1002197
- Bleich, E., Stonebraker, H., Nisar, H., & Abdelhamid, R. (2015). Media Portrayals of Minorities: Muslims in British Newspaper Headlines, 2001–2012. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 41(6), 942–962. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2014.1002200
- Carilli, T. (2021). Marginalized Voices in the Global Media Dialogue. In Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Communication. https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190228613.013.1136
- Comerio, N., & Strozzi, F. (2019). Tourism and its economic impact: A literature review using bibliometric tools. *Tourism Economics*, 25(1), 109–131. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1354816618793762</u>
- Coninck, D. D., Matthijs, K., Debrael, M., Joris, W., Cock, R. D., & d'Haenens, L. (2018). The relationship between media use and public opinion on immigrants and refugees: A Belgian perspective. *Communications*, 43(3), 403–425. https://doi.org/10.1515/commun-2018-0016
- Curato, N., & Ong, J. C. (2015). Inclusion as Deliberative Agency: The Selective Representation of Poor Women in Debates and Documentaries about Reproductive Health. *Television & New Media*, 16(6), 576–594. https://doi.org/10.1177/1527476414554401

- Filho, L. B. S., Coelho, R. C., Muniz, E. C., & Barbosa, H. D. S. (2022). Optimization of pectin extraction using response surface methodology: A bibliometric analysis. *Carbohydrate Polymer Technologies* and Applications, 4, 100229. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carpta.2022.100229</u>
- French, L. (2014). Gender then, gender now: Surveying women's participation in Australian film and television industries. *Continuum*, 28(2), 188–200. https://doi.org/10.1080/10304312.2014.888040
- Donthu, N., Kumar, S., & Pattnaik, D. (2020). Forty-five years of Journal of Business Research: A bibliometric analysis. *Journal of Business Research*, *109*, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.10.039
- Govindarajan, G., Geetha, K. A., Patra, S. K., & Sreekumar, T. T. (2023). Enhancing social capital and reciprocity through community news media during COVID-19: A study of video volunteers. *Online Information Review*, 47(7), 1396–1414. Scopus. https://doi.org/10.1108/OIR-09-2022-0514
- Hjarvard, S. (2008). The Mediatization of Society: A Theory of the Media as Agents of Social and Cultural Change. *Nordicom Review*, 29(2), 102–131. https://doi.org/10.1515/nor-2017-0181
- Hurley, R. J., Jensen, J. (Jake), Weaver, A., & Dixon, T. (2015). Viewer Ethnicity Matters: Black Crime in TV News and Its Impact on Decisions Regarding Public Policy. *Journal of Social Issues*, 71(1), 155– 170. https://doi.org/10.1111/josi.12102
- Jacobs, L., Claes, E., & Hooghe, M. (2015). The Occupational Roles of Women and Ethnic Minorities on Primetime Television in Belgium: An Analysis of Occupational Status Measurements. *Mass Communication and Society*, 18(4), 498–521. https://doi.org/10.1080/15205436.2014.1001908
- Jamil, S., & Retis, J. (2023). Media Discourses and Representation of Marginalized Communities in Multicultural Societies. *Journalism Practice*, 17(1), 1–4. https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2022.2142839
- Kent Baker, H., Pandey, N., Kumar, S., & Haldar, A. (2020). A bibliometric analysis of board diversity: Current status, development, and future research directions. *Journal of Business Research*, 108, 232– 246. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.11.025
- Klocker, N. (2014). Ethnic Diversity *within* Australian Homes: Has Television Caught up to Social Reality? *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 35(1), 34–52. https://doi.org/10.1080/07256868.2013.864628
- Lai, C., Gu, M., Gao, F., & Yung, J. W. S. (2022). Motivational mechanisms of ethnic minorities' social media engagement with mainstream culture. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 43(5), 387–403. https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2020.1738442
- Laskar, K. A., & Amir, S. (2022). The Underrepresented 'Other': Portrayal of Religious Minorities in Hindi Language Cartoon Shows. *Journal of Creative Communications*. Scopus. https://doi.org/10.1177/09732586221103953
- Marino, E. K., & Faas, A. J. (2020). Is Vulnerability an Outdated Concept? After Subjects and Spaces. *Annals of Anthropological Practice*, 44(1), 33–46. https://doi.org/10.1111/napa.12132
- Mastro, D., & Tukachinsky, R. (2012). The Influence of Media Exposure on the Formation, Activation, and Application of Racial/Ethnic Stereotypes. In A. N. Valdivia (Ed.), *The International Encyclopedia of Media Studies* (1st ed.). Wiley. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781444361506.wbiems118
- McLaughlin, B., & Rodriguez, N. S. (2017). Identifying With a Stereotype: The Divergent Effects of Exposure to Homosexual Television Characters. *Journal of Homosexuality*, 64(9), 1196–1213. https://doi.org/10.1080/00918369.2016.1242335
- O'Dell, E. J. (2023). Disability on Arab screens: Cripping class, religion, and gender in Syria, Egypt, and Lebanon. *Disability and Society*, 38(8), 1410–1434. Scopus. https://doi.org/10.1080/09687599.2021.1997715
- Park, R. E. (1928). Human Migration and the Marginal Man. *American Journal of Sociology*, 33(6), 881–893. https://doi.org/10.1086/214592
- Strand, C., & Svensson, J. (2019). "Fake News" on Sexual Minorities is "Old News": A Study of Digital Platforms as Spaces for Challenging Inaccurate Reporting on Ugandan Sexual Minorities. *African Journalism Studies*, 40(4), 77–95. https://doi.org/10.1080/23743670.2019.1665565
- Tukachinsky, R., Mastro, D., & Yarchi, M. (2015). Documenting Portrayals of Race/Ethnicity on Primetime Television over a 20-Year Span and Their Association with National-Level Racial/Ethnic Attitudes.

Journal of Social Issues, 71(1), 17-38. https://doi.org/10.1111/josi.12094

- Tusan, M. (2017). Genocide, Famine And Refugees On Film: Humanitarianism And The First World War*. *Past & Present*, 237(1), 197–235. https://doi.org/10.1093/pastj/gtx036
- Wang, Y., Mohamed Salim, N. A., Subri, S., & Zhang, X. (2023). Analysis of Viral Advertising Research Hotspots and Trends Based on Bibliometric Methods. *Studies in Media and Communication*, 12(1), 206. https://doi.org/10.11114/smc.v12i1.6399
- Wen, H., & Huang, Y. (2012). Trends and performance of oxidative stress research from 1991 to 2010. Scientometrics, 91(1), 51–63. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-011-0535-2
- Zhang, K., Zhuang, H., Lu, C., & Zhang, J. (2023). Discursive representations of sexual minorities in China's English-language news media: a corpus-based study. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 10(1), 1-11. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-023-02301-w